CONTENTS

I. Message from Minister for Interior ............................................. 2
II. Acknowledgements from National Coordinator NACTA ................. 3
III. Preface ................................................................................. 4
IV. Executive Summary .................................................................. 5
V. Introduction: ............................................................................. 6
   A. Process of Formulation ......................................................... 6
   B. Legal and Policy Basis: ......................................................... 7
      1) National Internal Security Policy ................................. 7
      3) National Counter Terrorism Authority Act, 2013 ........... 7
   C. NAP & Operation Zarb-e-Azb: CT & CE Complementarity for Peace Consolidation ................................................................. 8
   D. Extremism: Definition .......................................................... 9
   E. Vision ................................................................................. 9
VI. Drivers of Extremism ................................................................ 10
   A. Gaps in Service Delivery ..................................................... 10
   B. Service Delivery- Patwar, Thana aur Katchery ................... 11
   C. Service Delivery-Health & Education ................................ 11
   D. Capacity Building of LEAs ................................................. 11
   E. Law Enforcement ................................................................ 11
   F. Accountability .................................................................... 11
   G. Economic Opportunities .................................................... 11
   H. Region Specific: Gilgit-Baltistan ........................................... 12
   I. Region Specific: Federally Administered Tribal Areas ........... 12
   K. Region Specific: Sindh ......................................................... 13
   L. Region Specific: Punjab ......................................................... 13
   M. Region Specific: Khyber-Pahtun Khwa ............................... 13
   N. Region Specific: Balochistan ................................................ 13
   O. Erosion of Community Living-Challenges of Rapid Urbanization ................................................................. 13
   P. Communication and Media ................................................ 14
   Q. Madressah Mainstreaming ................................................ 14
   R. Education Reforms and Enrolment .................................... 15
   S. Prison Reforms .................................................................. 15
   T. Overcrowded Prisons-Reclamation and Probation ............. 16
   U. Cultural Erosion ................................................................ 16
VII. National Counter Extremism Policy Guidelines to Counter Extremism and Violent Extremism ................................................................. 17
   A. Rule of Law and Service Delivery ....................................... 17
      1. Strengthening Districts ....................................................... 17
      2. FATA Mainstreaming ......................................................... 17
      3. Resource Allocation to LEAs ............................................. 17
      4. Strategic Planning ............................................................. 18
      5. Accountability ................................................................ 18
   B. Citizen Engagement ............................................................. 18
      6. Connect to Your Environment ......................................... 18
      7. Local Area Committees for Peace and Welfare: Ilaqa Committee Baraye Aman wa Behbud ................................................................. 19
   C. Media Engagement ............................................................... 23
      9. Two-way Communication ................................................ 23
      10. Victim Humanization and Deconstruction of Violent Narratives ................................................................. 23
      11. Post-Incident Communication Strategy ............................. 24
      12. Council of Complaints ...................................................... 24
      13. Media Cell on Counter Violent Extremism ....................... 24
      14. Issuance of Media Cards ................................................ 25
      15. Online Behaviour Code of Ethics ..................................... 25
      17. Teacher Training .............................................................. 26
      18. Enrolment ..................................................................... 26
      19. Curriculum Scrutiny Mechanism ..................................... 27
      20. Provincial Text Books Repositories .................................. 27
      22. Critical Thinking and Dialogical Exercises ...................... 28
      23. Religious Education and Student Interactions .................... 28
      24. Teaching Global Civilizations .......................................... 28
      25. Madaris and Contemporary School Teacher Exchange Program ................................................................. 29
      26. Common Value System .................................................... 29
      27. Community Service ........................................................ 29
      28. Internship Programmes within State Departments ............ 30
      29. Debates on Contemporary Issues under Guidance of Religious Scholars and Leaders ................................................................. 30
      30. Counter-narrative Library ................................................. 30
      31. Art and Culture Education ............................................... 31
      32. Mother Schools ............................................................... 31
      33. Electing of class monitors in schools .................................. 31
      E. Reformation, Rehabilitation, Reintegration and Renunciation ................................................................. 31
      34. Mapping of Prison inadequacies ....................................... 31
      35. Rehabilitation Centers ..................................................... 32
      36. Probation and Parole ........................................................ 33
      37. Special employment opportunities ................................... 35
      38. Ulama Boards ................................................................. 35
      39. Auqaf ............................................................................ 35
      40. Establishment of Reconciliation Commissions ................... 35
      F. Promotion of culture .......................................................... 36
      41. Inter Provincial Cultural Exchanges and Cultural Hubs .......... 36
      42. Promotion of Visual Arts: Following steps may be undertaken for promotion of visual arts: ................................................................. 36
      43. Promotion of Theater ....................................................... 37
      44. Folklore and Traditional Culture ...................................... 37
      45. Preservation of Visible Culture: Archeological Sites .......... 38
      46. Passing on Cultural Heritage to Next Generations .............. 38
      47. Cinema ......................................................................... 39
      48. Music Academy: Following steps may be undertaken as per context: ................................................................. 39
      49. Protecting Culture of Minorities ....................................... 39
      50. Protecting Endangered Cultures, Cultural Sites, Crafts and Languages ................................................................. 40
Message from Minister for Interior

The National Counter Extremism Policy Guidelines (NCEPG) depict the resolve of Pakistani state and nation towards consolidation of peace achieved through sacrifices rendered by our armed forces, law enforcement agencies and most significantly the citizens of our beloved country. These envision entrenchment of peace leading to prosperity for one is not possible without the other. NCEPG manifests my vision for a prosperous Pakistan, which can be realized through a peaceful Pakistan. It has been carefully woven through a rigorous deliberative process involving rich mix of stakeholders from diverse backgrounds that lends plurality, legitimacy, and ownership to the final outcome.

It is a long road towards generating attitudes for co-existence, dissent with tolerance and peace. The NCEPG are a step towards bringing harmony amongst people. They bespeaks of the resolve of the government to work through an integrated model espousing whole of government and society approach. No effort at countering and preventing violent extremism is practicable without involving society as implementation partner. I am delighted that stakeholders from civil society, academia, media, and religious figures inter alia played a part in the process of formulation. I am certain they will play their due role in its realization.

Youth, women and marginalized segments of our society stay at the heart of the NCEPG. Inclusion of society and establishing connections between State and society are the end objectives. Globalization and urbanization are not without challenges. State and society have to jointly work to safeguard the minds and hearts of its citizens. Freedom, plurality and peaceful co-existence are the messages and ultimate goals to be achieved through this framework. I hope this will go a long way in entrenchment of peace not only in terms of security but also in hearts and minds of our people.
II Acknowledgments from National Coordinator NACTA

The National Counter Extremism Policy Guidelines are the pathway towards an inclusive, connected, peaceful and harmonious society. The Minister for Interior gave his full and unequivocal support to NACTA as an organization and in effective performance of its functions. NCEPG is the speaking proof of the support and trust of Minister Interior in the Authority and future of peace in Pakistan.

The inclusion of more than 305 stakeholders in the process of formulation of the guidelines and endless rounds of discussions made it a challenge for every stakeholder to evolve a holistic and well-rounded document. I commend and thank all our partners in development of the guidelines, who diversely belonged to political leadership, religious scholars and leaders, academia, media, civil and military bureaucracy, psychologists, youth, legal fraternity, civil society organizations, non-governmental organizations. I am immensely delighted to extend my heart felt gratitude to them for their rich participation and valuable input in the process. It was a long journey and was made possible only because of support and partnership with each of our members. I would commend the Director General CVE, Marryam Khan for her unflinching commitment and hard work in this significant work of national importance and for coalescing the vast number of stakeholders and converging all efforts towards a single objective of producing a strategy for peace and harmony in society. The NCEPG reflects her dedicated efforts towards formulating guidelines for developing CVE strategies.

NACTA has called the NCEPG as “CONNECT” Strategy since the spirit and raison d’être is reviving lost people to people and people to state connections. It is a holistic document entailing detailed policy guidelines for provinces regarding viz. efficient service delivery, improved performance of LEAs, rule of law, building citizen trust in state as service provider, taking state institutions down to basic administrative levels, media engagement, education reforms covering public, private and madaris, promotion of our rich culture going back to centuries and establishing cultural industrial hubs, women and marginalized community uplift, national reconciliation, prison reforms, rehabilitation, reintegration, and renunciation, and upholding the Constitution of Pakistan as the grundnorm.

I conceived it to be policy guidelines for all and by all and today I humbly thank the Almighty that it has more partners and few critics and even the criticism is constructive. NACTA believes that these are the bed-rock for joining hearts and minds and in putting an end to supply side of extremism since it is a war of ideas. A whole of society and government approach is the spirit of CONNECT, where people and government comes together to deny space and air to terrorists and extremists. Our sacrifices are innumerable, our losses painful, our history written with brave blood, and our resilient society stands together to counter and banish extremism from our environment and our lives.

I once again thank the Minister Interior and our partners in developing these guidelines, which will consolidate the gains achieved through brave sacrifices. I hope that the everyday life in fear is replaced with a life of hope and prosperity for our state and society, which is possible through a mind-shift by joining hands together by state and society, thus a whole of society and government strategy for peace, inclusion, co-existence, and hopefulness.
 PREFACE

Over the last few decades many areas of the world have experienced varied forms of violent extremism and terrorism. Pakistan has not been spared such troubling events which have largely emerged because of factors not of its choosing. The country’s geographical location, associated regional stress-lines and weak or inconsistent internal policies have made the country vulnerable. Fortunately, for Pakistan much success has already been achieved and the worst appears to be over owing to the myriad sacrifices made by its people and the security forces. Much more however needs to be done in different fields.

Of all the possible causes that allowed extremism and terror to foster in Pakistan the prime cause may well have been the weakness and inability of State to enforce its writ over all its territory and people. A State by definition must be strong and effective with a monopoly over the possession and employment of force and the authority and obligation for providing basic socio-economic needs and good governance to its people.

A responsible State is the bulwark against elements disseminating an extremist mindset and hostile conduct. The State machinery in order to ensure its writ has to act proactively to neutralize and bring to justice all anti-state actors. This provides the opportunity for peace and security which leads to the creation of an enabling environment where human resource development and peaceful resolution of disputes takes central stage.

The National Counter Extremism Policy Guidelines have been prepared as a long term mechanism to address violent extremism and organized terror which threatens not only the country but also the world at large. It projects an effective and inclusive role for different State and Society’s agencies through an Action Plan to improve the reach and delivery of the required services to the citizen. As such the rule of law and State-Citizen interaction stands at the heart of the NCEPG.

The guidelines have integrated various immediate and long term initiatives and suggested administrative and social environment to optimize the impact of the activities. The reform spectrum ranges from educational reforms, rule of law and service delivery, people’s engagement, cultural integration among others. These are cross cutting areas that need urgent attention of the Federal and Provincial governments for embedding peace in our society. Piecemeal responses or interventions will not bring the desired results. In view of the recent developments in the regional and global spheres, it is imperative that a holistic institutional response to counter extremism be implemented at all levels.

I commend the officials of NACTA and its National Coordinator Mr. Ihsan Ghani for providing guidance in developing this guideline framework. I also appreciate the untried efforts of the Director General, Ms. Marryam Khan, for holding exhaustive deliberations and formulating a well-rounded response.

Mr. Shakil Durrani
Ex-Chief Secretary Sindh and KPK
Executive Summary

The National Counter Extremism Policy Guidelines have been formulated through a multi-disciplinary and cross-functional process stretched over 34 rounds of deliberations with over 305 stakeholders. It envisages a guidance framework for formulating policy responses by federal and provincial stakeholders to counter violent extremism. It is founded on a whole of government and society approach for formulation and realization of these guidelines. It is embedded strictly in context of our society with an indigenous approach towards problem and solution identification. It is a process to CONNECT people to people and government in a positive, constructive and harmonious model.

Identification of causal-factors making a conducive environment for breeding extremist ideologies and violent outpours has been made through participants from belonging to political leadership, provincial governments, religious leaders and scholars, academia, media, psychologists, economists, youth representatives, civil society organizations, non-governmental organizations, business community, legal fraternity, civil and military bureaucracy through 34 rounds of exhaustive discussions. Specialized and cross-functional deliberations have been undertaken. Localized and contextualized problem identification is the hallmark and foundation of the guidelines.

Six identified major areas for formulating policy interventions include:

I. Rule of law and service delivery,
II. Citizen Engagement,
III. Media Engagement,
IV. Integrated Education Reform,
V. Reformation, Rehabilitation, Reintegration, and Renunciation, and
VI. Promotion of Culture

These broad areas have well-thought out and resource efficient sub-projects, which include efficient service delivery, protection of life, liberty and property, building citizen trust and reliance on state, establishing direct people’s relationship with government through district administration for better service delivery. The guidelines further include integrated education reforms covering public, private schools and madaris to end polarization and divides, establishment of provincial text-book repositories, curriculum revision mechanism with vertical and horizontal linkages, exchange programs between madressah and contemporary education student and faculty, online behavior code of ethics. Media is an integral partner in these guidelines, which can play a valuable role in humanization of victims, portraying essence of our national values and message of peace as enunciated by Islam. A media cell on CVE is also envisaged, which may devise a post-incident media communications strategy. Guidelines include formulation of projects for promoting welfare of minorities and strengthening women rights, linking to our living and magnificent culture and traditions, inter-provincial cultural interactions and cultural industrial hubs, entrenching democratic traditions and values. Strengthening of probation and parole regime are recommended to end prison over-crowding and hardening of first time offenders inter alia. Institutions, family and community inclusive mechanism has been espoused for rehabilitation, reformation, reintegration, and renunciation of violence by extremists and former terrorists, to name some. These guidelines do not require any legislative amendments. Majority interventions envisaged in these guidelines are resource efficient. The legitimacy and ownership of the document is the hallmark of the entire process and exercise. It aims at changing hearts and minds with emphasis on our core values for peace. Objective is to connect people to people and people to government. It aims to end isolation and will lead to development of integrated communities which are less vulnerable to influence of terrorist elements. These are also not envisioned to be static rather monitoring and evaluation based course corrections by concerned stakeholders are at the heart of these guidelines. It also includes an implementation plan. The NCEPG is an outcome of a rich and exhaustive efforts by most prominent members of our society, who gave their time and vision for ensuring peace in our society through joint work by governments and people.

Ihsan Ghani
National Coordinator
NACTA

Marryam Khan
Director General (CVE)
NACTA
Introduction

The National Counter Extremism Policy Guidelines for Pakistan have been formulated through a multi-disciplinary process wherein 34 rounds of deliberations were held. Participants ranged from provincial governments, political leadership, religious scholars and leaders, academics, media, legal fraternity, civil society etc. A broad-based consultative workshop was concluded by the Minister for Interior as held under the aegis of National Counter Authority Pakistan. A Steering Committee was formulated with cross-functional representation to evaluate, refine and turn the proposals of the workshop into implementable and actionable guideline framework for provincial governments to design their counter extremism responses and policies. On the 3rd January 2018, the Minister for Interior further evaluated the contours of the NCEPG and stressed upon the resolve of the government to bring enduring peace to our society.

NCEPG bespeaks of resolve of government to consolidate the peace achieved through successful implementation of National Action Plan, Operation Zarb-e-Azb, Karachi Operation and Operation Radd-ul-Fasaad. These guidelines will compliment the counter terrorism measures undertaken by the government to eradicate terrorism and extremism from our soil and achieve lasting peace through initiation of soft measures by provincial and federal stakeholders, while taking hue from these guidelines formulated through an extensive deliberative process.

It has been prepared in line the principles of national and international legal framework, National Internal Security Policy and best international practices. The Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973 was the spirit and standard followed during the multiple rounds of discussions for formulation of these policy guidelines for a democratic, harmonious and peaceful society. Special attention has been given to ensure that fundamental human rights and liberties as given under Chapter I and II of the Constitution are reinforced and strengthened through them.

A. Process of Formulation

Multi-disciplinary approach was adopted in formulation of the policy guidelines in line with democratic principles laid down in the Constitution of Pakistan. From across Pakistan, academics, religious scholars and leaders, political leadership, minority representatives, media personnel, civil and military bureaucracy, psychologists, civil society organizations, non-governmental organizations, development experts, legal fraternity, and members of provincial departments were brought together to discuss and contribute in the formulation of NCEPG. 34 rounds of specialized and cross-functional meetings were held.

A multi-disciplinary and cross-functional workshop was held around six themes, wherein the participants of all previous meetings were divided into six thematic groups. The workshop proceedings were concluded with submission of minimum three recommendations by each group and formulation of a Steering Committee by the Minister for Interior. The Steering Committee held further rounds of deliberations including meeting with provincial police and home departments to finalize the policy guidelines.

NACTA further held meetings with representatives from Information, Home, Auqaf, Tourism, Local Government and Rural Development Departments. Meetings were also conducted at Karachi, Sindh and Quetta, Balochistan with senior representatives from afore-mentioned departments and officers from NACTA. Representation from all 4 provincial governments and Federating units including Azad Jammu and Kashmir, Gilgit Baltistan and Federally Administered Tribal Areas was ensured. The NCEPG is an outcome of long and rich deliberative process by diverse stakeholders.

NCEPG has extensively examined various international models and best practices in the field of Counter Violent Extremism. It has evaluated and benefited from the efforts made by international fraternity to fight the common enemy. Thus, all efforts have been directed at producing a well-deliberated and balanced document. On the 3rd January 2018, the Minister for Interior further expressed resolve to strengthen counter terrorism and extremism responses through stakeholder policy responses on lines of NCEPG.
B. Legal and Policy Basis:

NCEPG is formed in background of factual on-ground security situation and rests on a well-embedded policy and legal support framework. The legal and policy foundational framework for passage of the NCEPG is as under:

1) National Internal Security Policy

NCEPG is a step towards realization of vision of NISP. NCEP reaffirms the vision to “create a safe environment where life, property, civil liberties and socio-economic rights of the citizens are protected and the people of Pakistan are able to live and prosper in harmony, freedom, respect and dignity as enshrined in the Constitution of Pakistan”, 1973.

The promotion of pluralism as in para 11 and 12, comprehensive response plan as given in para 16, reconciliation as in paras 14 and 22, rehabilitation as in paras 18 & 19, Reintegration, youth engagement strategy and mainstreaming of madaris as in paras 24, 25 and 26, de-radicalization programmes as per paras 35, 36, 38, 39, and 42, establishing international cooperation networks as per paras 55 and 56, as given in part I of the NISP have also been kept in consideration in development of NCEPG. Principles of “inclusiveness, integration, human rights and gender mainstreaming” as per para 53 of NISP have been woven in the NCEPG framework.


The Constitution of the Islamic Republic Pakistan, 1973 stood as the guiding document in shaping the discussions and their outcomes. The NCEPG envisions an institutionalized role of citizens in at basic administrative levels, socio-economic decision making, and building their stakes in the system. Objective is to ensure more robust awareness and enforcement of Fundamental Human Rights as enshrined in Chapter I of the Constitution of Pakistan. Rights of minorities and marginalized segments have been specially focused in NCEPG.

Principles of Policy have been integrated in formulation of interventions as given in Chapter II of the Constitution. The role of women as victims, sympathizers and problem solvers of extremism has been given due attention. Council of Islamic Ideology due to its functional significance and role elevation as per Article(s) 228 and 230 has also been included to work towards entrenchment of values of peace and tolerance in our society by projecting true values and injunctions of Islam. The Constitution is the fountainhead for the NCEPG.

3) National Counter Terrorism Authority Act, 2013

The Act of 2013, vide Section 4 (b), (c), (e) and (g) obligates the National Counter Terrorism Authority to:

- “Coordinate and prepare comprehensive National Counter Terrorism and Counter Extremism strategies, and review them on periodical basis,”

- Develop plans against terrorism and extremism and report to the Federal Government about implementation of these plans, on periodical basis,”

- Carry out liaison with International entities for facilitating cooperation in areas related to terrorism and extremism” and

- Appoint Committees of Experts from Government and Non-Government organizations for deliberations in areas related to mandate and functions of the Authority”

NACTA, is mandated and empowered to prepare, plans and guidelines for countering terrorism and extremism. It is also empowered to evolve review mechanisms for their implementation.
C. NAP & Operation Zarb-e-Azb: CT & CE Complementarity for Peace Consolidation

Cumulative effect of simultaneous counter terrorism measures is evidenced in dramatic decline in incidence of terrorism (Annex-A), which necessitates immediate complementary counter extremism regime to ensure continuity of peace. Present government has evolved an effective internal security regime, wherein multiple simultaneous federal and provincial security strategies were robustly executed and monitored as discussed. The steps include:

- Regular Intelligence Based Operations by the Law Enforcement Agencies,
- Establishment and extension of military courts through 21st and 23rd amendments,
- Lifting of moratorium from death penalty and establishing sanction of law,
- Cyber-crime laws and implementation regime including passage of Prevention of Electronic Crimes Act 2016,
- Renewal of the Afghan Refugee Registration by NADRA in collaboration with the UNHCR refugee agency,
- Revival of the Pakistan Automated Fingerprint Identification System (PAFIS),
- Establishment of the Integrated Border Management System (IBMS) and its integration with NADRA,
- Police and Intelligence databases,
- Action against hate speech and misuse of loudspeakers (Annex-B)
- Reporting and immediate action mechanism on 1717 counter terrorism help line at NACTA, wherein the scope of the helpline is extended to include reporting of hate speech to take the matter to public sphere,
- Imposition and implementation of complete ban on media appearance and coverage of extremist elements,
- Reconciliation efforts in Balochistan and laying down of weapons by Farraris,
- Karachi Operation and marked decline in terrorism, extortion, murder, kidnapping for ransom inter alia (Annex-C)
- Successes in Operation-Zarb-e-Azb,
- Progress achieved through Operation Radd-ul-Fasaad,
- Youth engagement steps with colleges and universities,
- Cabinet approval of FATA Reforms Committee Report for mainstreaming of FATA,
- Complete biometric verification of SIMS across the country by MoI and PTA,
- Capacity building of CTDs and establishing vertical and horizontal linkages between provincial CTDs and FIA in Countering Terrorist Financing,
- Proscription of organization and steps under law regarding asset freezing, arms embargo and movement restriction,
- Rationalization of lists of individuals on IVth schedule, freezing of accounts of IVth schedulers by NACTA and SBP,
- Mainstreaming of madaris wherein KPK government has already placed madressah under the Education department (Annex-D)
- Development of data and registration forms for the registration of madaris in consultation by NACTA in consultation with Ittehad-e-Tanzeem-ul-Madaris Pakistan and endorsement by all provincial home departments and LEAs,
- Formulation of a National Charity Regulation Law at NACTA wherein the government of Sindh is also in process of formulation of legal response to illegal and unauthorized collection of charity,
- Public-private partnership for regaining online space through CS Wing NACTA,
- Establishment of J oint Intelligence Directorate at NACTA,
- Functionalization of NACTA through adequate human and financial resource provision by the government,
- Development of Criminal Justice Reform Package including all four pillars viz. prisons, police, prosecution and judiciary through a deliberation process with provincial and federal stakeholders from all concerned agencies in 2017.

Above-mentioned are remarkable measures towards improving internal and external security in a passage of three years. Marked decline in incidence of terrorism is the speaking truth of the sincere efforts in fighting terrorism through implementation of NAP and the successes of operation Zarb-e-Azb as given in Annex-A. The terrorists’ capabilities have been visibly diminished and damaged and the sanction of law established across the country.
Continuity and sustainability of peace achieved is conditional upon severing the supply line of terrorists’ viz. the ideological propaganda. NCEPG is aimed to strike at the ideological cobweb of extremist and terrorist propaganda based on falsehood and distortions manipulated to serve their aim for spreading unrest and dissonance in society. It has a whole of government and society approach and is predicated on citizen inclusion and engagement.

D. Extremism: Definition

Extremism is broadly identified as having absolute belief in one’s truth with an ingrained sense of self-righteousness. The entrenched sense of righteousness enables the holder of belief to grow judgmental attitude towards other people’s beliefs followed with intolerance. Extreme polarization will divide society into ‘us and them’. Such extremist behaviour is then likely to be accompanied with violence symbolizing dismissal of diversity and an urge based on conviction in justness of need for imposition of one’s belief system to exclusion of rest. Such violence is also motivated to further social, political and economic objectives. The National Counter Extremism Policy Guidelines is a strategic framework for minimizing chances for such intolerance and violence in our society wherein provincial governments may form policy responses to eradicate these evils from our society.

E. Vision

- Protect and reinforce values, rights and duties under the Constitution of Pakistan.
- Inter-Provincial robust cooperation, deconstructing socio-ideological polarization and social integration of citizens.
- Coalescing efforts of federal and provincial stakeholders in entrenchment.
- Better governance and service delivery through public inclusion and effectiveness of state institutions at district and tehsil level to regain citizen trust and engagement with State.
- Dialogue, debate, dissent and duty to respect disagreement.
- A peace loving, tolerant and harmonious society with respect for disagreement and love for human liberty and dignity.
VI Drivers of Extremism

Subject dilation of drivers of radicalization is based on field experience from relevant provincial stakeholders, political leadership, civil military bureaucracy, religious scholars/leaders, media representatives, psychologists, youth representatives, lawyers, civil society organizations, non-governmental organizations, prison authorities, field operatives, who were a part of deliberative process of NCEPG, wherein 34 rounds of meetings were held with cross-functional stakeholders. It is recognized that each territorial constituent unit had different problems but common roots. Also chronic unresolved issues were observed linking these problems across all provinces and federating units.

The reasons identified are as follows:

A. Gaps in Service Delivery

Writ of the State has been established with counter terrorism measures including operation Rah-e-Rast in Swat, Zarb-e-Azb in North Waziristan, Karachi Operation, Operation Radd-ul-Fasaad, Intelligence Based Operations and Combining Operations by LEAs inter alia. The lifting of moratorium from death penalty has contributed to realness of legal sanction and reduction in terrorist incidents. Supremacy of law and writ of State have been established with these measures.

It is required to now restore further confidence in State as service provider particularly in conflict hit areas including Balochistan, Sindh, and FATA. The basic unit of the administration in Pakistan is the revenue district with a population, outside the metropolises, of between one and three million people approximately. It is the center where people live, own land and property, earn their livelihood, interact with each other and get involved in disputes and conflicts. District is the meeting point between state and citizens and is ought to be the most important unit in State hierarchy. Over the last forty years the District departments have gradually decayed due to under-strength operational departments, shortage of funds, centralizing placement and decision-making, inter alia.

It should be emphasized that Writ refers not only to the physical or spatial presence of State through law enforcement personnel in all geographical areas but also in the ability to ensure compliance with the constitution and laws of the land. The essential requirement of communal living means that personal security, dispute adjudication and conflict resolution remain the primary obligations of the State. In addition the obligatory and smooth provision of socio-economic services in the health and education sectors and the human rights guarantees are also the responsibility of every State today. Where this characteristic is weak, the vacant spaces are controlled by hostile and belligerent groups. As the presence of the law enforcing agencies of the State weakens or is seen to be absent other competing elements replace them and make their physical presence felt. Nature abhors a vacuum in more ways than one! To sustain their hold the competing groups resort to forcible exaction of informal taxes the ‘bhattas’ and the residents, particularly the businessmen, have no option but to buy security from them. To this is added the proceeds from criminal acts such as kidnapping for ransom, extortion and indulgence in contraband traffic. Such an environment leads to the forced evacuation of the income and employment generating segments of the community from the area. Available jobs shrink and the unemployment created feeds into extra-legal activities with the vicious circle expanding.

Over last many decades, the importance and effectiveness of the District as a service provider has weakened. The working of the administration at the District and Tehsil levels had become weak, resource-starved and therefore ineffective. In the decade and half since the promulgation of the Devolution Program, notwithstanding its positive features, led to a weakening of the local administration and with it the responsibility for the maintenance of peace, security and tranquility in the District. A joint effective working mechanism between district administration and local governments is imperative with service delivery and public security at the heart of such arrangement.
B. Service Delivery- Patwar, Thana aur Katchehry

Effective service delivery is linked at district level with the Thana, the Patwar and the Kutchehry that require specific interventions. The Police is mandated to protect life, liberty and property through the Police Station/Thana. The Land Administration agency under the Patwar records and regulates the land ownership and the immovable property while, the District-level Courts or the Katchery are responsible for adjudicating the disputes that arise. The concerns of a great majority of the people revolve around these three agencies with the State providing the enabling laws and the means of ensuring compliance with the laws. With exception of digitization of land record by Punjab Land Revenue Authority, the land record system remains manual and cumbersome. Unfortunately all these three are in severe default causing much anger and frustration.

C. Service Delivery-Health & Education

Besides these three core responsibilities of the State the health, education, irrigation, and drinking water supply departments are similarly deficient in trained manpower, equipment and resources for the maintenance of their established assets and provision of services. Inefficient service delivery results in trust deficit in governments. Strengthening of the provincial governments should be supplemented with devolved resources and responsibilities to district administration. From transport, housing and fuel needs to the allocation of budget required for effective functioning of the District departments require reinforcements.

D. Capacity Building of LEAs

Law enforcing agencies of the State, civil and military, were structured and trained to deal with ordinary criminal activity and conventional defence respectively. The emergence of new ideology driven players with agendas and dramatic rise in quantum of crime and terror activity has challenged the capacity of most law-enforcing entities. The Police and Levies had struggled to tackle normal crime but the introduction of the extremist operating in a charged environment led to further exacerbation of security situation. As a result the internal security scenario has stretched the ability of all law enforcing agencies to the limit.

E. Law Enforcement

Due weightage has been given to handling of terrorist cases after the establishment of Special Trial Courts. The ordinary crime as a continuum starts with low-level intemperate speech-making to distribution of hate literature, where the perpetrators skillfully try to remain within the letter of the law. Inability to implement the law results in multiplied severity of violence ending in heinous crimes such as extortion, kidnapping or murder. Such ineffective enforcement of law is apparent to hostile elements, who move with minimum risk towards ideological extremism, low intensity terrorism and then armed insurgency against the State. These activities could differ in intent, conduct and content but all are designed to create serious physical and psychological impact detrimental to the State.

F. Accountability

Accountability mechanism for LEAs for security lapses requires improvement such as holding someone responsible for attack on the Sri Lankan cricket team, the savage raids on the school and university in the Khyber province, forced release of jail inmates at two places, or lynching of Mashal Khan to name few incidents. Checks may be internal but accountability has to be external for lapse of security. Absence of external accountability of district police needs serious deliberation and intervention. Security of life is the foremost constitutional right of citizens and responsibility of state therefore any lapse has to be dealt with strictly through accountability mechanism and a course correction regime, where best practices are recorded for replication and loopholes are identified for avoidance in future.

G. Economic Opportunities

It is clear that over the past seventy years material progress and economic development leading to employment opportunities in the Tribal Areas, large parts of Baluchistan and KP have remained well below those available in
the more developed areas of the country. Most tribesmen today live outside the tribal areas not only because of the insecurity but also due to the absence of employment.

This is also the case with the economies of KP and Baluchistan. Hundreds of small private industries and businesses from these provinces have either closed or moved to other areas. In the less developed parts of the country, the private sector investment is not readily forthcoming and the public sector outlays have to compensate for the deficiency in a bold and meaningful manner.

**H. Region Specific: Gilgit-Baltistan**

Gilgit-Baltistan is beset with issues regarding sub-nationalism, sectarian terrorism, constitutional uncertainty, representation claims in Parliament, and share in NFC award. The border discord between Diamer and Kohistan, KPK and Ghizer and Chitral have affected enjoyment of fundamental rights regarding economic opportunities and freedom of movement. Major causal factors behind these issues are cited as lack of education, unemployment, hate-speech and literature, unchecked social media, share in NFC award, foreign funding and weak writ of state.

**I. Region Specific: Federally Administered Tribal Areas**

Problems of FATA are exacerbated due to multiple age-old national, regional and international factors and interests at play in the area. Linkage is drawn between 1990 Taliban government and entrenchment of extremism and violence. Ancillary factors include erosion of tribal system, target killing of elders, silencing of voices/opinions, elimination of jirga and riwaj, creation of generation gap, occupation of hujra and masjid, and psychological paralysis of society through:

- Distribution of slaughtering videos and threatening pamphlets,
- Target killing of government servants,
- Ban on social activities,
- Anti-State and anti-social activities.

Militancy has damaged the history and socio-traditional fabric in FATA. The targeting of government institutions, forcible halt to their functioning, collapse in trading activities, paralyzing the political administration system and martyring or rendering dysfunctional the levies and khasadars have been identified as reasons behind anchoring extremist mindsets and behavioural patterns.

A major factor decried during discussions was rendering Maliki institution dysfunctional. Reasons also included loss of communication between Administration and people, border issues and management, under-development, legal status complexities and treatment as theatre of war. Present Government’s, FATA Reforms Committee Report regarding mainstreaming of FATA is a silver-lining for its future. A steady approach with inclusion of all stakeholders will augur a better future for FATA.

**J. Region Specific: Azad Jammu and Kashmir**

Provincial stakeholders identified issues including slow criminal justice system, weak rule of law, parallel system of education, silo mentality in government departments/institutions, weak regulatory framework, indigenous political movement in Indian Held Kashmir (IHK) and its fall out for AJ K, absence of uniform and standardized basic police legal framework, ill-integration between formal and informal judicial systems, absence of use of modern technology and case management in courts. Recommended solutions included political and social integration, better treatment for victims and witnesses, institutional oversight and accountability, responsible media, responsive governance, uniform basic education system, environment protection and improving police capacity.
K. Region Specific: Sindh

Sindh presented complex and different set of problems varying within different areas of the province. Cited problems include sectarian divisions and discords, attacks on imambarah, processions, eidgah, shrines, public places, train blasts/attacks on railway tracks, attacks against public places, target killing of minorities, police, LEAs, religious leaders. Causes behind the unrest are linked with foreign involvement, ethnic based politics, sub-nationalist organizations, illegal immigration, cross provincial border terrorism, gang wars, capital driven terrorism, turf wars, drug wars.

L. Region Specific: Punjab

Factors include sectarian divisions including Brailvi, Deobandi, Ahl-e-Tashih and Ahl-e-Hadith, inter-sect and intra-sect rivalries, violent manifestation of such rivalries, terror-sectarian networks, ideological exploitation of sentiments on the plea of Jihad, specific geographical pockets with simmering issues, pan-Islamic appeal by regional and international terrorist organizations, local narratives, and modern day instruments of ideological propaganda including social media and also propaganda in academic institutions were counted in problems.

Other factors at play are subversive elements operating in South, Talibanization and trans-national terrorism, terror financing and recruiting, instability, lack of institutional strength, planning and implementation weaknesses, absence of broader de-radicalization programs, madaris and education reforms with focus on teachers and students alike, inculcation of media responsibility, public demotivation, social media behavior and regulation, sense of deprivation and exploitation, socio-economic push and pull factors, ideological vacuum, weakening writ of state, discord between opinion makers and national narrative, absence of policy and preparation for focused response to extremism.

M. Region Specific: Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa

Extremism is manifested in forms including sectarianism, religious persecution, distortion of religious injunctions, hate-speech and literature, sense of deprivation amongst provinces, left and right wing political ideologies, smuggling, addictions, border control, archaic traditions including swara, wani, etc. Issues entrenching extremist mindset also include political uncertainty, mass unrest, governance problems, rule of law, delayed justice, abuse of law and authority, non-provision of basic amenities. Areas proposed for intervention included counter radicalization strategies, reforms in madaris, border-control mechanisms, social inclusion and awareness, education and health reforms, and better governance.

N. Region Specific: Balochistan

Baloch tribes must be understood as essentially tolerant of diversity and secular in nature. Issues are most complex and may be called primordial. Although sometimes ancient traditions and social structures are cited as part of problem, notwithstanding the practice, the exclusion of traditional social set-ups will put question mark on sustainability and effectiveness of interventions. Sparse location of populations, entrenched sense of deprivation, ethnic divisions, share in NFC award, provision of basic amenities, education facilities, health facilities, dispute resolution mechanisms, abolition of office of District Magistrate as central grievance redress point at district level, lack of a coherent narrative for national integration are issues of disenchantment and extremism.

O. Erosion of Community Living-Challenges of Rapid Urbanization

Rising urbanization, securitization and digitization of communications are factors acting in various degrees behind mechanization of life and reduced person to person contact. Geographically contiguous populations in dense urban centers have lost connectivity, which accentuates chances of infiltration, perpetuated existence and consequent threats of extremist and terrorist elements. These factors facilitate presence and smooth communication of terrorist elements. It is not intended to limit the threat to urban centers as the threat finds
conducive growth and operative environment in both urban and rural localities due to easy communication, mobility and shadowy existence with no connectivity or surveillance mechanism in surroundings of agents.

Whereas, surveillance of such elements is an apt response but the question remains of its adequacy. National Action Plan has provided a robust mechanism of combing operations and Intelligence Based Operations. (Annex-E) Security surveillance as adequate defense against spread of ideology based radicalization by these elements remains questionable. Problem is accentuated due to presence of these elements in disconnected, unaware, isolated population centers, which might also be intractable at times.

Traditional mediums of interaction and communication have been replaced with global interaction, communication and networking. Open spaces for youth interaction are both shrinking and opening to extremist elements for casting influence. In present times, parent influence and control over activities of children is neither fully practicable nor a solution to problem at hand. The widening person to person gap amongst multiple actors with basic unit as family and going up the ladder to state and non-state entities enables radical and extremist elements to manipulate vulnerable minds to a point, where the parents are taken by shock. Pertinent to mention that this isolation is not merely affecting youth but whole families. Inter-linkages and inter-connectivity has to be redefined in context of Pakistan. Defining this interconnectivity will not be an easy one time task and will never be a one-size fits all approach across length and breadth of a vibrant and diverse society like ours. Therefore, a dynamic, evolving, flexible and inclusive approach has been recommended to integrate scattered populations amongst themselves regardless of caste and creed and only on the basis of geographical proximity and possibility. It will shrink the physical space and invisibility of these elements to operate unchecked.

**P. Communication and Media**

Extremists and terrorists have effective and active propaganda machineries with an unchecked freedom to touch extremes in propagating their ideological proposition. Such unfettered freedom is not available to the moderate elements and even state. Civility and tolerance always operate within boundaries and defined parameters. In this scenario, significance of media and urgency of a coherent intervention cannot be overstated.

Pakistan Telecommunication Authority has been running an e-portal for report of illegal content, which it can block and further make request to social media houses for removal of such content online. However, the mechanism needs further strengthening. Online spaces remain open to majority of population without effective mechanism to present the true meaning and message of peace in Islam. Media needs urgent attention with a long-term vision driven intervention.

Response of media is commendably responsible and mature after the Army Public School attack and National Action Plan. “Ban on Glorification of Terrorism” was implemented in letter and spirit particularly on mass media having a vast public outreach. Coverage was totally banned for members of proscribed organizations, who had linkages with extremist or terrorist agendas. Media to conduct itself in accordance with the spirit of Constitution of Pakistan.

**Q Madressah Mainstreaming**

The number of madaris exceeds 30 thousand across Pakistan. Government envisions madaris as partners in fight against extremism. Committees have been formed under Higher Education Commission and Federal Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education for equivalence status to madaris. Need for mainstreaming of madaris was underscored in the National Action Plan. NAP meetings have stressed the urgency of treating madaris in the right trajectory i.e. Education Department since these are educational institutions.
The madaris registration and data maintenance forms have been developed by NACTA and Ittehad-e-Tanzeem-ul-Madaris Pakistan, which were duly consented to by the provincial governments and law enforcement agencies. It has further been decided to shift the subject of madaris to Education Department. Linkage with Home Department for data maintenance had been supported at NAP meetings at NACTA. Introduction of contemporary subjects including English, Mathematics, Sciences, Pakistan Affairs, and Global Civilization, Civics, inter alia need to be introduced in madaris.

Foreign students’ record maintenance and audit of accounts of madaris have been emphasized during the meetings. Declaration of renunciation of violent teachings or activities to be made condition precedent in registration of madaris. The madaris and contemporary school system are to have a teachers exchange programme. Moreover, the service structure of imam and khateeb in Auqaf regulated madaris also needs intervention for better on job performance and adherence to rules and regulations.

R. Education Reforms and Enrollment

Recent incidents of students from contemporary academic institutions affiliating with international terrorist groups or hordes of students lynching their fellows for suspicion of alleged blasphemy are trends pointing towards horrendous developments, which can be ignored only to our detriment. Academic institutions should ideally be barriers to dissemination of extremist ideological propaganda. Terrorist attempted to decimate these institutions since they run contrary to their propaganda and world vision. Education content has been discussed and believed to be amongst causal factors behind ideological extremism, if and when not drafted, evaluated and revised with due care and deliberation. Curriculum will set foundations for religious tolerance and respect for minorities and diversity. It may not be a static one time drafted curriculum but should be revisited and revised periodically with room for course corrections.

S. Prison Reforms

Ensuring safety of prison environments and safeguarding detention centers from becoming academies and universities for radicalization and recruitment have assumed immense significance for security officials throughout the world, at the expense of sustainable reforms that may benefit the prisoners and community in the long run. Peer to peer radicalization has been neglected in Pakistan. Rehabilitation and reintegration of prisoners/inmates back in to their societies after release is imperative rather than simple detention and prevention from radicalizing and recruiting others. The process is highly important not merely because of its impact upon detainees but also on their immediate family members, relatives, friends and even the communities of detained individuals.

A well designed and implemented program will not only help disengage and de-radicalize inmates, but will also ensure safety against prison radicalization and building community trust in general. It will dissuade the circles of the reformed individual from treading the extremists’ path that is denounced for futility and falsehood. Although, prison reform history will have multiple vocational and educational programs to rehabilitate criminals and to provide them a humane environment, however we find solitary instances to rehabilitate or reform terrorists or extremists such as Sabaoon in Swat.

Previous sections deal with establishing the writ of the State and most significantly improving service delivery for citizen trust and convenience. Reformation, Reintegration, Rehabilitation and Renunciation programmes need to be institutionally initiated, where select categories of extremists and other classes of individuals leaning to extremism be included. Efforts would be required constantly to ensure that there is minimum relapse to the earlier conditions. Programme will be comprehensive with an oversight mechanism after the individual is sent back to society for reintegration.

Attempt should be made to rehabilitate the individuals through the families, local village elders, Ulema, psychological intervention and economic incentives and not through imprisonment or physical incarceration. To provide alternate livelihood there would be immense need for Education with Scholarships, Technical and Vocational training, provision of Grants and Loans through cash transfers for Employment-generating activities and Small and Medium Enterprises.
A well designed and executed 4 R program will go a long way towards reducing the recidivism rate amongst released prisoners. It will also ensure better safety of community by diminishing the potential risks posed by releasing a hardened, unprepared, ill-equipped and active extremist back in to society. Routine, ill, unfair, harsh treatment of detainees will reinforce their conceptions and result in failure to win the trust of their family members. It ends up in cultivating a new generation of descendants of violent extremists vouchsafing to seek revenge on the system, state, its officials and other members of society. An unattended extremists thrown back in to society is as dangerous as a live grenade ready to explode resulting in either actual physical damage or spreading extremists’ ideology.

T. Overcrowded Prisons-Reclamation and Probation

Good Conduct of Prisoners’ Probational Release Act 1926, Good Conduct Prisoner’s Probational Rules, 1927, Sections 380, and 562-564 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, 1898, Probation of Offenders Ordinance, 1960 and West Pakistan Probation of Offenders Rules 1961, Juvenile Justice System Ordinance, 2000 inter alia deal with probational aspect of criminal justice system. Probation, parole and bail deal with release of offenders at various trial stages and is directly related to enforcement of rights of freedom of movement and dignity of man under the Constitution. Implementation of Probation and Parole services is essential to ensure that people in conflict with law are not deprived of their inherent right to freedom, family life and of becoming productive citizens of society. It is a pre-condition for success of a reformation, rehabilitation, reintegration and renunciation programme as it will impact upon over-crowding in prisons and will reintegrate offenders back in society at early stages and protect them from getting indoctrinated and lapse in to extremism and terrorism. It is an early intervention and redress mechanism.

Release of prisoners on probation and parole is dealt by Reclamation and Probation Directorates that are attached to Home Departments in provinces. Each Directorate is headed by a Director R&P supported by Deputy Directors, probation and parole officers, office superintendents and other administrative and support staff. The High Court, Court of Sessions, Judicial Magistrate & any other specially empowered Magistrate are empowered to exercise jurisdiction under Probation of Offenders Ordinance, 1960 inter alia. The Assistant Director Parole, Superintendent Jails are responsible for referral of parole lists to executive i.e. concerned Home Secretary. Mechanism to ensure that maximum number of legitimate cases are referred for probation and parole is imperative in an effective reformation and rehabilitation policy. Archaic laws, inefficient post-release surveillance mechanism, dearth of officers in proportion to number of prisoners, and additional official responsibilities of probation and parole officers are major problems stopping maximum referrals for probation and parole.

U. Cultural Erosion

Our rich culture goes back to 10,000 years back to Mehergarh. Civilizations including Bolan valley, Indus valley, Harappa, Mohanjodaro, and Gandhara bespeak of the eroded connection with our rich cultural inheritance. Due to past neglect several cultures, languages, traditions, crafts and forms of music have deteriorated to the extent of extinction. Reclaiming our past is a critical gateway to shaping our future. Many Muslim countries provide illustrations of how religion can, does and should co-exist alongside diverse cultural histories, whether of the Persian Empire, Turkish era or Egypt's reign over antiquity, to create assimilated, multi-layered national identities.

Civilized nations invest in cultural infrastructure like museums, theatres, cinemas, art galleries, cultural centers, studios, concert halls, public parks, auditoriums, etc. These become anchors of creative hubs. Providing support to such cultural infrastructure at all levels should be a high priority of the State. Provinces may set up cultural infrastructure, at least, at the Divisional or District headquarter level as cultural industrial hubs.

Our cultural diversity is reflected in every aspect in the country. Geographically it has a terrain ranging from sea level to over eight thousand meters elevation. It has among the highest mountain ranges in the world and brown, white and grey sand beaches, glaciers and deserts, and a wide-ranging topography in between, each inhabited by different communities and cultures. It houses UNESCO World Heritage Sites from the remains at Taxila to Shalimar Gardens in Lahore, Makli Tombs Monuments and Rohtas Fort. Pakistan has architecture such as Shah Jahan mosque and Wazir Khan mosque, Ranikot Fort and Baltit Fort, and shrines such as
Shah Rukn-e-Alam and Bibi Jawindi. It has over 80 spoken languages branching from Indo-Iranian, Dravidian, Tibetan origins, though many are endangered languages with few speakers left. A conscious effort is required to bring to the fore not just the presence and beauty of this variety but also what each symbolically represents.

National Counter Extremism Policy Guidelines to Counter Extremism and Violent Extremism

Following are the policy guidelines for stakeholders to formulate implementable policy responses to counter extremism and violent extremism in Pakistan. These are long term and are intended to cure trust deficit between state and citizen, foster social inclusion, infuse tolerance for diversity, consolidate peace, squeeze the supply base for terrorists, and promote a peaceful society for a prosperous and bright Pakistan.

A. Rule of Law and Service Delivery

1. Strengthening Districts

The focus of authority and responsibility should only be the District or even lower in the Tehsils, where all material and security needs of the people are met. Strengthening all departments of the District Administration through additional recruitment of personnel, ensuring transparency, effective professional training and the provision of transport, equipment and operational budgets is sine qua non for efficient service delivery.

Security of tenure is the most important factor, while posting personnel especially of the police. One of the most cost-effective means of providing service delivery and crime control is by ensuring certainty in tenures. Posting out before completion of a decent tenure should be on grounds of non-performance or infringement of rules inter alia. This would also ensure that officials would be able to resist external pressures. The output of an official, who has spent a few years at a position can be twice as effective as that of a newly posted one.

The pays and allowances of Government personnel to be adequate to the needs of the times. In addition, rewards and compensation for exemplary output may be given in terms of awards, honours or financial incentives. Rewards may not entail out of turn promotion since that results in demoralization for others.

2. FATA Mainstreaming

The Federally Administered Tribal Areas, as already recommended by the FATA Reforms Report, needs to be mainstreamed as a Special Area in the Khyber Pukhtunkhwa province upon consultation with all stakeholders. The development budgets would also need to be increased substantially over the next two decades to gear up development in FATA and Baluchistan. In addition to building physical infrastructure imperative for development of any region, it is essential to place greater emphasis on ensuring universal literacy, primary health care, provision of clean drinking water and electricity.

Financial and tax incentives may be provided to attract investors and as a first step the Government may provide a subsidized electricity tariff for specified industries in notified locations. Additional quality vocational and technical training institutes are required and the existing ones to be improved. People, who have relocated to the more developed areas in the country to find employment can be persuaded to work closer to home.

3. Resource Allocation to LEAs

As the malcontents/insurgents are defeated, it is for the civilian government to consolidate peace and security through the District Police, Constabulary and comparable agencies particularly in the tribal areas and Baluchistan. The provincial forces may be strengthened in terms of resource provision, training, weapons/armoured vehicles and above all in provision of secret funds to cover small intelligence-based operations.

It has been learnt that District Police chiefs even in KP and Baluchistan have little or no secret service funds to undertake intelligence-based operations, which ordinarily should be the highest priority today. Built-in...
parameters of institutional responsibility and accountability can be devised for transparency. The money may be provided to the District Police chief directly within strict parameters of institutional responsibility and accountability involving the provincial Home department as an additional check on transparency. Adequate financial resources may be provided per province under the ‘SS’ head during such tumultuous times, to conduct operations imperative to preempt incidents of violence through information and intelligence. The Frontier Constabulary and similar forces in the provinces would now also need to assume much greater responsibilities in the Districts.

4. Strategic Planning

There is an urgency for long term and futuristic planning to bring the least developed areas at par with the developed districts. A strategic/long term perspective plan for the future years may be prepared to allocate much greater resources to FATA, KP, Balochistan, Interior Sindh and South Punjab. It will enable opening up of the inaccessible areas through road and rail network, development of hydropower, irrigation, agriculture and livestock facilities and simultaneously provide on priority the basic socio economic needs of the people.

Limited road communication, inadequate literacy and health cover, scarce drinking water and sewerage facilities and lack of employment opportunities should be redressed at the earliest. Land use planning and regulation is deemed imperative as the cultivable and forested lands are scarce and need to be conserved at all costs. All cities, towns and villages may be master-planned with identified zonings. Unplanned habitations like those surrounding all our cities including Islamabad, Lahore, Karachi, Quetta and Peshawar lead to slum developments, which is only a first step towards lawlessness and serious crime. Incremental progress stretched over decades is not what is aimed at as this would delay development and leave these areas vulnerable to all kinds of pressures and unwanted influences. Immediate impact is required. In addition to strategic planning for development and immediate implementation strategy, following may be given top priority:

Provision of basic needs of the people should be ensured. In the Education sector there should be schools for all with furniture, books and teachers with the target of 90% Net Enrollment in 3-5 years. In Health, hospitals with doctors, laboratories and medicines for everyone are imperative. Similarly clean drinking water, municipal and sewerage services should be made available and a service charge may be levied.

Employment generation through education and in particular Vocational and Technical Training may be made available in such areas. In place of some of the general universities in fashion today, which are producing unemployable post graduates, focus should be centered on job creation in technical subjects.

5. Accountability

There is in effect minimum accountability of personnel in Government mainly because of the water-tight hierarchy, where officials are responsible and accountable only to their line superiors. There is little in the shape of extra departmental responsibility and accountability as far as the normal functioning of the departments is concerned. A watchdog, who could redress routine deviations, delays and corrupt practices would help people develop a greater stake in the system. For example if the registration of an FIR is delayed or case investigation takes too long or a mutation not incorporated in time someone must take notice. A District Ombudsman or an Executive Magistrate may provide the solution.

B. Citizen Engagement

6. Connect to Your Environment

A localized assessment of problem and solutions have been made throughout the process of formulation of these interventions. Family has been perceived as the basic unit for intervention to integrate both vertically in communities and horizontally with state institutions as a unified front against extremist ideologies. Objective is people’s engagement with multiple state and non-state entities to generate external environmental awareness, real sense of responsibility towards ourselves and our environment, assessment of impact of imminence of threat and therefore value of connectivity transcending beyond cellular or digital connectivity. Seclusion should not only end in neighbourhoods but also between citizenry and service providers. Vertical and horizontal connectivity for individual and common benefit is the solution.
Rule of law and governance issues have been cited as common roots of extremist tendencies and problems. Ending state-citizen gap will benefit both ways. People centric and inclusive approach will prepare people against the threat and devise their own cognitive abilities as defense against such elements. Multiple actors may be involved with emphasis on upside of inclusive interaction and developing citizen awareness, capacity, access and trust in the state institutions. Bodies may be established at state level with novel and diverse composition to work as a whole towards achieving unified and connected neighbourhood and society.

Islam emphasizes upon being kind to our neighbours and it is essential to know our surroundings to enable us to help others and also be aware of the lurking dangerous elements around us. Thus, know your neighbor and know your environment campaign may be entrenched in our system with state and citizen partnership having a people centric approach. It is a whole of society and government approach where state institutions will collaborate to build trust and diminish distances. An added benefit is better governance. However, any such activity may not to be for profiling of citizens or as security surveillance mechanisms in communities.

7. Local Area Committees for Peace and Welfare: Ilaqa Committee Baraye Aman wa Behbud

Figure 1. Ilaqa Committee Baraye Aman wa Behbud

a. Formation of Ilaqa Committees may ideally be made at local level with concerned Assistant Commissioner or District Coordination Officer/Deputy Commissioner as Chief Coordinator of these Committees along with equivalent Local Elected Representatives as conveners. Composition may further includes District Police, Health department, Education Department, Auqaf Department, Social Welfare Department, Agriculture Department, Livestock Department, local notables/elders, Environment Department, Waste Management Authorities, Micro Finance Organizations, Civil Society Organizations/Non-Governmental Organizations, Technical and Vocational Training Institutes, Rural Support Programs, and any other person or entity deemed essential by concerned Assistant Commissioner, DCO/DC or Provincial Government. These departments/institutions already have their presence at district level.

b. These committees may be established at District level under the DCO and AC through field operatives at basic union council level or at tehsil or district level. Overall supervision of the functioning and achieving of assigned targets by these Committees may be undertaken by Specialized/Centralized Monitoring Units as an effective mechanism for monitoring and accountability of these Committees, wherein most seasoned officers shall be posted. Thus, these are cross-cutting, multi-agency, cross-functional state, civil society and people inhabiting spaces established by government and people of localities in joint collaboration. Monitoring and evaluation mechanism for effective performance and target achieving of these committees may be evolved by the supervisory authority at CCMU.
c. Ideal entrenchment of committee and mobilization level is Union Council with responsibility over the Assistant Commissioner to formulate Committees in collaboration with afore-mentioned actors. Committees may be notified at the District level (with information to the Provincial Central Monitoring Units established at level of CM Office). Alternatively, any province or administrative entity may opt to form such committees at the district level with DCO/DC as Chief Coordinator as observed by Balochistan. Provinces may add actors to enrich role and performance of these Committees.

d. Departments, mentioned vide Para 8(a) are under the provincial government with limited role for the Assistant Commissioner. However, notably all these departments have presence at district or even tehsil level. Assistant Commissioner in collaboration with equivalent Elected Representative may form committees at Union Council level, wherein local notables, local public, local cleric, local teachers, local lady health workers, local SWD officers at tehsil level, local doctor are all a part of these Committees with the Secretary Union Council as subordinate convener of these committees at union council/basic equivalent level. The Committees may perform following primary roles:

- Localized Mapping of Issues & Solutions:-Systematic Union Council wise record of issues/problems may be prepared and up-dated through these committees as they are linked at local level. In this manner, the local wisdom for ingenuous solutions and problems will be made available in form of a living data-base. The data or record can be utilized with the Planning and Development Department(s) to formulate more informed and realistic development policies.

- Citizen Engagement Projects:- Organization of activities with locals wherein government and non-government actors may interact with local population at office premises of secretary union council or premises identified for any such activity. Examples of activities include livestock & animal husbandry training and competitions, local fairs, mushaira, soft loans, local handicraft, Govt. of Punjab sports clubs, green campaigns, sports galas, vocational and technical trainings, medical camps, celebrating local heroes, theater, street cinema, population control, lessons in better parenting inter alia. Small groups may also be engaged for 4-6 meetings for period of 3-4 months, which will end in making good will ambassadors at local level. Multiple activities are being undertaken at districts and tehsil level. The aim is to simultaneously engage select groups of locals as active participants in already on-going activities (e.g. vocational training, or those benefitting from a medical camp etc.) and enlist their support for community mobilization and integration. In addition to benefiting the population in general through agricultural interventions, sports activities, etc. these select groups will be support mechanism for reducing gap between state and citizenry and building defense against entrenchment of hostile elements.

- Dispute Resolution:- Local Representatives, Jirga / Panchayat, Non-Binding ADR Forum role may be assigned to the office of the Assistant Commissioner in collaboration with the equivalent elected representative. These offices may work in close concert with local police, where essential.

e. Local District level Health Department, Education Department and Auqaf Department representation is already present in form of lady health visitors, teachers/principals, imam and khatheeb. Physical infrastructure for public engagement is already present at local level at Union Council, Teshil and District level with office premises and halls available to hold public meetings.

f. These committees may be given dispute resolution role in select subject matters as discussed in deliberation rounds with provincial stakeholders. Traditional dispute resolution mechanisms including Panchayat and Jirga are being given formal legal dispute resolution mandate at Federal level. These Committees may also co-opt members from traditional local ADR mechanisms including Panchayat and Jirga.

g. Mechanism entails all existing human and physical resources as a well deliberated and in-built strategy for immediate implementation keeping in view the imminence and gravity of issue at hand. Thus, it is resource efficient.

h. These will utilize the existing resources with focus on the basic administrative unit (union or neighbourhood or village council or equivalent) or may be established at District level, where practicality of initiating at
such basic unit level is minimum. Establishment and notification of these committees may be undertaken immediately by the AC, DC/DCO to the Special/Centralized Monitoring Units at offices of Concerned Chief Ministers. Balochistan indicated practicality and usefulness of these Committees at the District level keeping in view the population concentration and ancillary issues. Remaining provinces showed agreement for constitution of these committees at Village or Union Council level. (TORs for functioning of these Committees are given along with Implementation Plan).

Composition and Linkages - Illaqa Committee barae Aman wa Behbud

i. These Committees will be an enabling the office of the Assistant Commissioner and Elected Representatives to become direct link between local public and provincial departments as service deliverers. People may be given lectures, trainings, micro-financing, environment campaign, resolve disputes inter alia. It may be made binding on Secretary Union Council to hold a specified minimum number of activities each month and report to Assistant Commissioner and Elected Representatives. Police may be included in these meetings for changing image and ensuring accessibility. Assistant Commissioner (where, Illaqa Committee established at Teshil level) may hold meetings on monthly basis for a specified number of time. Deputy Commissioner/District Coordination Officers and Elected Representatives at equivalent level may be designated as jointly overall in-charge of these Committees.

j. At provincial level a Central/Specialized Monitoring Unit may be established at office of Chief Ministers, where most efficient officer to be posted as head along with representation from various departments to respond to districts and establish effective liaison between departments and districts.

k. Software may be developed whereby all three functions as at para 8 (c) are reported by Secretary UC to AC, who will upload it on a dashboard for Centralized/Specialized Monitoring Unit. The “dashboard” may have 4 major components, which are:

- Tap local wisdom through mapping local service delivery and development related issues and solutions proposed by locals,
- Activities generated by Assistant Commissioner and Elected Representatives or Secretary Union Councils,
- Narratives of success by local people who benefit from such activities,
- Local specialties, tourist spots, hotels, culture, cuisine profiling along with available tourist operators or guides details.

l. Narratives of local people, who have benefitted from such interaction or participation, may be uploaded on dashboard by the Secretary Union Council through the Assistant Commissioner or as the hierarchy of establishment goes. These will be shared through public interface of the dashboard, which is in fact a face of alternatives and hope.

m. A public interface of selected activities particularly local culture, narratives and activities will be available for public view other than the private view of dashboard, which will have select audience.
Figure 2: CCMU Dashboard
C. Media Engagement

9. Two-way Communication

Media can no longer be construed as one-way informative and entertaining medium of engagement. Media types and forms have diversified and multiplied including print, mass/electronic and social media. Access of extremist elements to media is limited to either social media, print media, radio but rarely direct coverage has been given to their point of view in electronic media. NAP made direct reference to ban on “glorification of terrorism”, which has been effectively enforced. Electronic media or Broadcast media remains a major public opinion influencer in Pakistan. Media management has emerged as a scientific discipline, wherein effective media campaigns are shaping opinion and results worldwide.

Pakistan has recently witnessed a positive proliferation of Broadcast media notwithstanding the criticism and demand for better monitoring and accountability of Broadcast media. Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authority Ordinance of 2002 provides a detailed mechanism for operations of media in the larger interest of state and society. The policy point introduced by National Action Plan regarding ban on glorification of terrorists led to complete stoppage of media coverage to any element espousing and promoting extremism, which is a highly commendable development and achievement. Definition of glorification would encompass coverage or promotion of content inducing or encouraging emulation of such extremist values or conduct. Thus, media coherent direction making to combat terrorism and extremism is imperative for any success and is also possible. A legal definition and parameters of ‘glorification’ is however deemed essential to provide clear guidance for reporting and regulating.

10. Victim Humanization and Deconstruction of Violent Narratives

Systematic dehumanization of enemy by terrorists to prepare followers undertake extreme violent measures against innocent civilians and other targets is a major propellant behind such inhuman and indiscriminate violence. Media may systematically and strategically work on a victim humanization approach. Victims and their families are our heroes and should be projected in a manner commensurate with their status. This may not be a solitary episode rather series of projects and programmes, which will be giving coverage to families of victims and survivors. It will project their human side and realness of their suffering and pain. Multiple channels have regular T.V. shows upon futility and repercussions of crime. In same vein, reality of family of victims and their suffering may be projected as a strategy for renunciation of use of terror tactics.

It should aim to expose defunctness of claim of division of the world in to “us” and “them”, evilness of violence, or senselessness of the argument that violence is liberating and transformative. Justification of violence may be countered with reinforced, continuous and repetitive portrayal of the reality of victim’s pain, their existence, loss to their families, humanness and innocence of the presumed enemy, futility of violence in achieving the desired political and ideological goals, isolation and marginalization, difficulty to legitimize the human costs etc.

In addition to humanization of the enemy, other issues including de-idealizing and deconstruction of violence, exploitation and internal strain in the extremist groups, bad and manipulative leadership, personal and practical issues such as guilt feelings, longing for a normal life and burn out etc. may be brought forth to expose truth behind membership and affiliation with such groups. It will generate loss of faith in militant narrative and realization of reality of humanness of enemy and self. Whereas, detailed coverage of other prevalent problems and also of personalities is covered on media. It was felt that media may also expose the sham claims of many of such extremist leaders. Such T.V. programmes may be sensitively designed and implemented with a nuanced communication approach that is well calibrated to not to be counterproductive.

An essential issue will be of careful selection of “messenger” or “change agent”. The “agent” has to be credible and convincing with ability to represent a different perspective from that of the militants’ in a non-threatening manner. It puts pressure on the militants’ narrative dividing the world in to ‘us’ and ‘them’ making them see their narrative from outside without directly attacking the extremist argument. Former terrorists or extremists can be utilized to expose the ugly side of violence since they have commonality with the terrorist and extremist.
A step further should be finding agents with affinity with audience, for example common friends, people having similar backgrounds, or interests, which is likely to promote reliance, and reliance enhances the ability of the agent of intervention to get through to the select audience successfully. Thus, programs may not only decry the loss and suffering of victims rather also project the views of former terrorists or extremists and reasons behind reforms. Only robust media intervention can lead to myth busting of terrorist groups and ideologies.

11. Post-Incident Communication Strategy

There has to be a post-incident reporting strategy that may be jointly evolved by Ministry of Information and Broadcasting, Information Departments in consultation with private media houses inter alia. There may be a “Post-Incident Communication Strategy” with a certain framework for reporting an incident. Aim should be avoidance of further spreading of fear, sensation and immediate classification of nature of incident without allowing the Law Enforcement Agencies or Investigation Agencies respond with a final incident evaluation report. Such classification and judgmental definitive reporting hammered repeatedly on the psychology of masses can produce negative and fearful minds, which are insecure and uncertain in their surroundings. Thus, a well-thought out strategy for objective, civilized reporting for information and positive social construction is the call of the hour, which may be strictly implemented by media without discrimination.

In some cases, such reporting can promote sectarianism and thus such communication may to be essentially within a framework. Broadcast judgments and evaluations may be avoided in interest of harmony and unity in society. Ministry of Information and Broadcasting, Provincial Information Departments in consultation with media houses may jointly evolve the strategy. The strategy should be implemented in letter and spirit as was the “ban on glorification of terrorists” was implemented by media.

12. Council of Complaints

Section 26 of the PEMRA Act, 2002 as amended in 2017 provides for establishment of Council of Complaints at the Federal and Provincial level. The formation of Council of Complaints is founded on well-established principles of holding media also accountable to masses whose opinions, beliefs and behavior are influenced and moulded by media. Ensuring media compliance to legal rules and regulations has been given to PEMRA by the Act. The functionalization and wider publicity of these Councils may be undertaken by media itself in collaboration with M/o I&B. Media influences people and may be made accountable to not merely institutional framework but take people as partners in ensuring positive and civilized journalistic trends.

13. Media Cell on Counter Violent Extremism

Establishing a media cell for Countering Violent Extremism by Ministry of Information and Broadcasting and NACTA can go a long way in synchronization of implementation of communication strategy for preventing violent extremism in society. Such a cell may have representation from media houses. Subsidiaries may be established at Provincial Information Departments with horizontal and vertical linkages for a coordinated effort and policy response. It may perform following functions in addition to any other role assigned by M/o I&B:

- Representation from media houses to allow formulation of a coherent and well-deliberated and calibrated response to issue at hand. T.V. talk shows may be regularly held to debate on issues concerning unrest, extremism and lack of unity in our societies. Such cell may have inbuilt Monitoring and Evaluation mechanisms to evaluate project/content spread and success.

- A joint Communication Plan may be devised by the M/o I&B and Provincial Information Departments for the dissemination and projection of the NCEPG. Dedicated media cell may be established for CVE with a communication strategy. The communication strategy should be primarily focused on generating awareness about the various projects and programs delineated in the Counter Extremism Strategy. Other concerned stakeholders may also be taken on board for a broader and richer strategy.

- Devising strategies in collaboration with Federal and Provincial Culture and Tourism Authorities to promote local and international tourism in Pakistan. Pakistan is blessed with beautiful weather and most exotic natural beauty. International media may be accessed for promoting tourism in Pakistan. Tourism Authorities
should be the lead agencies in devising such strategies with support of national media amongst other relevant stakeholders.

**14. Issuance of Media Cards**

During course of deliberations, it was recommended that since journalism is a highly sensitive, sophisticated and impact making profession therefore only the most suitable people should form part of this highly responsible and impactful profession. Balochistan faced phenomenon of people being issued media cards that sometimes resulted in professionally irrelevant individuals joining one of the most sensitive profession. Objective is to exert influence and wield undue pressure. It was discussed that issuance of journalist card may be done by concerned media agency in collaboration with Information Department, Government of Balochistan. Other provincial governments may also associate Information Department in devising consensus based mechanism for issuance of cards to media personnel especially press reporters.

**15. Online Behaviour Code of Ethics**

Communication has expanded beyond person to person or static information gathering. Global online connectivity is not without its dangers and use of these spaces with high effectiveness by terrorist elements reveal seriousness of the threat. Studies reveal that terrorist organizations enjoy extreme sophistication and mastery over on-line communication of their message. Enlistment of individuals to travel to their hotspots or teaching them ways to fight as lone-wolves without access to modern weaponry are few facets of the threat. Campaign to develop capability to discern online good facts from bad facts is essential and may be started alongside computer literacy education. Online behaviour awareness cannot remain limited to chapters in academic syllabus. The behavioural regime and legal repercussions for violations may be made available through broadcast mediums and television can be most effective and instrumental in spreading such awareness. Online “Ethical Behavioural Code” may be developed by Ministry of Education, Ministry of Information and Broadcasting, Ministry of Law, and NACTA in consultation with provincial stakeholders inter alia.

**D. Education Reforms**


18th amendment has devolved subject of Education to provincial governments. Notwithstanding, the devolution of the subject of education, the urgency and value of a broad National Education Policy reform framework cannot be overstated. Provincial governments and Federal government should coalesce their efforts in a single direction to diversify education with aim to promote pluralism and tolerance of differences. Broadened and diversified reform agenda is the urgent need. Ministry of Education and Professional Training already formulated a National Curriculum Policy and included themes on peace and countering extremism in collaboration with NACTA. *(Annex-F)*.

Recently, it has been deliberated that madaris are to be moved under the Department of Education under the National Action Plan. Private schools, public schools and madaris may be dealt under an integrated education policy with emphasis on the steps mentioned. There are over thirty thousand madrassa in the country educating hundreds of thousands of young people and these need to be made partners in education and development. There are also foreign students in these seminaries. Since the madrassas are a social safety net providing food and lodging besides imparting religious education there is a desire on part of many families to send their children there. They in the process are also equipped for one-end employment after completing their studies.

Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training is worked in concert with Provincial Education Departments for formulation of the National Education Policy. The interaction should to be a continuous one and a mechanism for sharing best practices and course corrections may be jointly evolved amongst federal and provincial actors. It will enable sharing and incorporating good practices and avoid repetition of failed initiatives. Two Committees under Higher Education Commission, FBISE and Ittehad-e Tanzeem-ul-Madaris
were handling issue of equivalence status of degrees to madaris. Integrated education reform policy may be introduced with provision of funds to hire teachers in madaris.

It is important that a consensus be created, and immediately, for inclusion of subjects like physical sciences, mathematics, English language, Business, Management, Civics, Constitution of Pakistan, Global Civilization, Culture, Calligraphy, and other areas mentioned herein in the curriculum of madaris. It will enable the students to find employment in diverse fields. A decade ago, most of madaris in Azad Kashmir willingly accepted government’s funds to hire teachers in English and Science subjects.

Education should emphasize on dignity of individual, freedom to profess religion and equality of citizens as given in Article 14, 20, and 25 of the Constitution of 1973. The principles laid down in Constitution apply uniformly to entire state with broad consensus and without exception. Taking Constitution as the guiding framework for reform will reiterate the sacrosanct values, which can galvanizing those in to an operative reality. All provinces and units may focus that education is imparted with an objective to prepare individuals as socially aware and integrative beings.

Individuals should be able to carve a better future for themselves and cultivate a broad vision to include future of society and world in their sight. Education in civics and student engagement with society may commence at early stages to generate social awareness and sense of duty as citizens. Thus, Fundamental Human Rights, Principles of Policy, Civics and Community Engagement models may be made an integral component of any strategic education reform framework adopted for implementation.

In addition to rights of minorities, the rights of marginalized communities including women may be taught from basic elementary level. Teachings of Islam on rights of women, domestic laws and international resolutions are may be taught to students. However, a module on women rights should be sensitively developed without segregating women rights as separate from human rights. Behavioural patterns of acceptance, rights and duties should be developed with regard to women. Our heroes are not to remain limited to men but female figures should be included too.

Office of the District Administration should be made responsible for ensuring 100% enrollment in schools. Moreover, interaction with the madrassas may be entrusted to the District Administration, the District Police and Special Branch concerned as they are in the best position to directly work with them. The Education/Religious Affairs Departments do not have the direct field presence to redress matters and thus vertical linkage needs to be established. The teaching of revised syllabi, audit of accounts, record maintenance of students and faculty inter alia may be managed by district administration and police jointly in liaison with other governmental stakeholders as discussed by provincial home department(s) during NAP meetings. Foreign funding and foreign students attendance in madrassas also needs to be stopped or strictly regulated at the District level in accordance with law and needs for security. Audit of madaris may be carried out as per decisions taken between NACTA and Ittehad-e-Tanzim ul-Madaris Pakistan, which may be held at district level.

17. Teacher Training

Focus should broaden from mere content reform to training of teachers (from public, private schools and madrassah) responsible for teaching the content in a particular way. Reforms may include rigorous and continuous training of teachers, contextualized handbooks or manuals for teacher trainings, identifying the areas needing particular focus, enhanced role of parents in assessing child’s behavior, to name few. These may revisit content, methodology for teaching and also evolve mechanism for engagement amongst students and external environment. Teacher training and performance monitoring mechanism should be diligently evolved. Local administration may be made responsible to supervise the quality of education as linkage of provincial government at district level.

18. Enrollment

Article 25-A of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan obligates the state to provide universal primary education to all citizens under 16 years of age. Article 22 allows public authorities to make provisions for advancement of any socially or educationally backward class of citizens. It also discourages teaching of any other religion but that of the recipient/student.
Universal primary enrollment remains a challenge in Pakistan. 100% net enrollment of children of school-going age in a locality has not been possible across the board despite having school infrastructure and teacher availability. An incisive approach for having 100% enrollment is required at provincial level. Incentives may be devised and significance of education emphasized. A parent will have to be convinced of the relative usefulness of sending their child to school instead of work or sitting idle. Admitting children to school should be made meaningful and useful both for children and parents.

19. Curriculum Scrutiny Mechanism

Identification of type of curriculum having most probable impact on radicalization and recruitment to violent extremism is stepping stone to evaluate reasons of unrest and intolerance in our academic institutions. The exercise may extend to public, private and madressah education system alike.

Addition of new topics in curriculum may come as the next step. Teachers, parents, academic experts, psychologists, may be taken on board altogether in identification of content likely to entrench divisions and induce violence. It will again be imperative to take parents from minority groups or communities on board in such committees to hear their views on course content in vogue. Upon identification and evaluation by designated authorities, the content should be removed from the syllabi. However, this exercise can be meaningful if it is perpetual and institutionalized.

A high level committee may be established at provincial level to exclusively evaluate the feedback received from schools as given by parents and teachers. The Five Year Education Plans may include the provision to form high level committee at provincial level for identification of such content at reasonable intervals as agreed by concerned governments.

The feedback mechanism may be established in schools to inform the provincial high level committee on annual basis upon the response received by teachers, students and parents on course content. Parents may be allowed to formally report to these school committees about content and mode of teaching to make education a two-way exchange process. The mechanism should specifically take recommendations for changes (if any) in the course. Such feedback may be submitted to the high-level committee. The high level committee may be solely made responsible to map issues in content taught and make recommendations to relevant Education Authorities/Department for reviewing the content as per practical feedback. The concerned provincial governments may make the recommendations of the committee binding or advisory in nature.

20. Provincial Text Books Repositories

Provincial text book repositories will enable researchers and scholars to undertake scrutiny of taught content in schools. All text books of all levels in schools may be made available to researchers, academics, scholars inter alia to independently evaluate the gradual hardening of dividing lines in our social fabric, mental regimentation, intolerance, culture of deference, extremist ideologies, distorted views of self and others to name few. These researchers should have the freedom to select area or field of research.

It will enable the provincial governments to have a parallel input mechanism in curriculum revisiting and reforming. Independence of these scholars will allow authorities to have a third party’s informed and evaluated review. Present absence of such repositories has limited the researchers’ ability to access and analyze only the content found through personal efforts, which might also not be complete for conducting a valuable research. Thus, the state may provide a rich basis for conduct of such analysis and research on the significant issue.


Learning has gone beyond teaching or books. Internet has changed nature and scope of knowledge and information. It has also dramatically transformed the mode of communication and thus models of violations of rights and laws. Making student’s computer savvy is certainly consonant with modern educational realities. Requirement is to take a further step by educating student online behavioural ethics and repercussions of violating the laws and rules. Scope extends to include public, private and madressah education systems.
In addition to awareness campaign as discussed at para 15 ante, an interactive learning model may be
developed to teach students how to differentiate good facts from bad facts. Access to online content is a reality
and thus young people should be educated to not to blindly follow the reality presented online. The literacy
campaign will make them better understand the hazards and benefits of online activities. It may also enlighten
them that all facts are not essentially correct and thus rational application of mind is essential before venturing
to associate with a certain opportunity given through online medium.

22. Critical Thinking and Dialogical Exercises

Higher secondary classes may also be taught the skill of critical thinking. Critical education is founded on the
principle of accepting multiple realities. It is based essentially in freedom of thought and expression as given
under the Constitution. It should build criticality for students and teachers including critical scholarship, critical
(dis)respect, critical thinking, critical doubt and critical lightness.

The need is not a base for replacement of a religious system but encouragement and debate about competing
rights. It should inspire a tolerant mind towards disagreement and debate and acceptance of grey in addition to
black and white. Debate and advice, religious or otherwise, is deeply embedded in the Islamic faith and culture.

That the Quran speaks of the blessing called “hikmat” and “knowledge” and “mushawarat” is supported and
practiced through-out Islamic history. The 600 year enduring Abbasid Empire formalized it in to state policy.
The reign of Harun-al-Rashid, who established the empire and made Baghdad it's headquarter is renowned
for this tradition. Dialogue, discernment, disagreement, defiance, investigation, criticism, and analysis will
promote moral development and independence of young minds protecting them from unwanted influences of
violent extremism.

23. Religious Education and Student Interactions

Education Reforms cannot be exclusive of religious education, which may also be administered with an aim to
project the message of Islam. The main objective may be to portray Islam in its pure state and to manifest what
it means to be a Muslim in this challenging and ever changing world and to promote greater understanding of
the true teachings of Islam and Muslims.

Influenced by this thought, the members of the Islamic Religious Council in Singapore (MUIS) and the Religious
Rehabilitation Program, a group of voluntary Muslim scholars from the Muslim community began organizing
public forums, talks and seminars in masajid and Islamic centers in 2006 in Singapore.

Thus, faith based universities, contemporary academic institutions and madaris may be included in the
process of debate within madaris and masajid and with contemporary education stream. These debates
may not revolve only around ideological or religious issues but on modern day problems. Issues regarding
adult franchise, contemporary education, West and Muslim world, globalization, positives and negatives of
development, civilization, art and religion, culture and social integration are but to name few issues facing
us which indirectly feed in to extremist mindset. Opening debate inter and intra religious and contemporary
academic streams will mitigate the differences and find common grounds. The entire efforts should be towards
finding common grounds.

24. Teaching Global Civilizations

Global civilizations may be introduced as a subject from basic elementary school level. It can build young minds
to understand and value the contributions of multiple civilizations towards the development of contemporary
world. Education may not inculcate sense of shallow superiority of one race over another but emphasize upon
centrality of collectivism and peace in fostering development and ending poverty. It should consciously work
towards putting an end to clash of civilizations. Straitjacketing of individuals in to historic and social boxes
leads to tunnel vision and antagonism towards any new idea. In a rapidly changing environment respect for
values and response to change should be inculcated in students.
25. Madaris and Contemporary School Teacher Exchange Program

An “Exchange Program” of teachers from contemporary education system and madaris may be initiated, viz. contemporary schools to have madaris teachers for imparting knowledge of Quran and madaris to have teachers from contemporary school system for teaching subjects including English, Mathematics, Science, Computers, Global Civilizations, Civics, Critical Thinking inter alia. It will allow both streams of education to interact and understand each other. It will end the communication gap, misperceptions, and allow debate in asking questions about other side.

Madressah teachers will have better employment opportunities. Schools may be required to admit children of such madressah teachers without charging fees. Concerned government may ask schools to exempt fees or establish special fund for assistance of children of such madressah teachers to enable them take quality education. Moreover, schools may start offering “hifz” to students who want to learn Quran. This will prepare scholars well versed in contemporary and religious education. It will spread true message of Islam upon peace and tolerance. Theological knowledge of Islam coupled with contemporary education will also challenge the ideological justifications by terrorists.

26. Common Value System

Extremists give young minds an identity that is dismissive of multiple identities and taking precedence over rest. It contextualizes such identity and ascribes it on to others. Thus, identity remains a central cardinal issue and challenge in reducing extremism. Giving identity to young people without labelling or hardening it to an extent that it conditions all behavior remains a challenge. It is juxtaposed to inculcating respect for civilizations and critical thinking inter alia. The value system may be equally applicable to all streams of education.

Education may promote acceptance for diversity and multiple cultures with appreciation for their value and beauty. Evolve and publicize a shared value system in our society that binds us together. It may be an inclusive package built upon the core religious, historic and social values of Pakistan. A common value system founded upon shared history, culture, traditions, interests, and problems will gradually bring all together. Rising rifts between various parochial and ethnic groups may be discouraged by adopting a policy of naming and shaming individuals involved in such acts. Cross cultural interactions may be promoted through one-to-one dialogue and media.

Our national interest should be defined. It may be defined to include security, sovereignty, internal prosperity and dignity of human effort. It should move away from negatives and antagonism. Focus may be on building citizens well versed in national values. Education should enhance the resistance to labels and categorizations and give children status by showing how original and special each of us is.

An intelligently drafted narrative and framework for implementation can reinforce such identity. The sensibly drafted narrative will not kindle cognitive defenses and shall recur in each layer from community to education to critical thinking to reforms etc. and sink in human consciousness. It may be made a part of our curriculum, media and daily political parlance.

27. Community Service

Reinforcing values through academic lessons should be supported through active engagement of students with people. Presently, many colleges are running community service projects independently or in collaboration with international organizations. However, community service program may be designed at provincial level under the Education department to ensure it is implemented across board.

Academics and community specialists should be taken on board to design the project. It may be a graded activity to encourage students to generate novel ideas for community service. It will go beyond spending time in communities, working in orphanage, attachment with CSOs etc.

While all these models are appreciated, the new project will allow students to develop small interventions on issues facing a particular segment of community. Working with marginalized women, religious minorities,
evening schools, teach a child, promoting entrepreneurship, are to name few projects that students can undertake. It will bring direct contact between communities and youth. To make youth realize our society and its issues is imperative to develop a response based on firsthand knowledge. First-hand information and knowledge in specific context will enable development of contextualized solution by youth.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Total Universities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Punjab</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Sindh</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Balochistan</td>
<td>08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Khyber Pakhtunkhwa</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Azad Jammu and Kashmir</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Gilgit Baltistan</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Islamabad Capital Territory</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

28. Internship Programmes within State Departments

There are 183 Universities and Degree Awarding Institutions recognized by Higher Education Commission, Pakistan. An internship programme for identified disciplines in each university enabling students to get attached with relevant department viz. department concerned to their research topic, can minimize the distance between state and youth. It will create ambassadors of good will and will allow state to learn from the research product produced by the students. Such internship will be culminating with award of certificate of completion by concerned department.

The topic selection may remain prerogative of the academic institutions to ensure neutrality. Standard operating procedures may be developed by Higher Education Commission and provincial Education Departments. The departments can communicate topics/subjects for research to the concerned university, which may not be binding on students or universities. Universities may be given complete independence in the domain to ensure students carry research in free and objective environment.

29. Debates on Contemporary Issues under Guidance of Religious Scholars and Leaders

The rationality and ideological appeal of terrorists have to be openly debated by clerics and people well-trained in religion. Colleges and Universities may have cross-disciplinary debates on issues related to politics, science, human rights, education, international relations etc. with madressah students. A team of senior most clerics and academics may be dedicated to have visits/rounds of such institutions to steer the course of discussions. The programme may be attended by Ulema from international fraternity as well to widen scope of discussions and inject objectivity. Special invitation may be given to clerics and Ulema from Saudi Arabia as they have a distinct place of reverence in our society.

30. Counter-narrative Library

It may be a part of the “Text-book Repository”. Narratives vested in historic, religious, scholastic, inter alia disciplines should be collected and made available at a single place. The concerned administrative authorities may organize periodical lectures and discourse solely focused in these narratives with students from colleges and universities. Essay competitions may be held and prize distributed for portraying the essential core values of being a Muslim in historical and contemporary context.
31. **Art and Culture Education**

It may be made a compulsory subject in schools and be taught by qualified teachers in public and private educational institutions. Pakistan National Council of Arts and Provincial Arts Councils may commission, preparation of a cultural curriculum for early and elementary education. Establishment of non-governmental and not for profit Art Institutions should be provided support by the government, development authorities and HEC as a priority. Cultural Institutions should be strengthened and BOGs of all cultural bodies may be made independent and representative of all provinces and disciplines of arts.

Culture education may be imparted in madaris too, while including the students in portraying the rich local cultures. Calligraphy may be promoted and recognized as exceptionally advanced ability of madressah students. Competition in calligraphy may be held and best calligraphists to be promoted at national and international levels.

32. **Mother Schools**

Mothers are the foundations for shaping mindset of children and in recognizing the vulnerabilities in children. Best safeguard against extremist mindset will have to be entrenched at home. Mothers to be made aware of the repercussions. They should be actively involved in the process of identifying and addressing vulnerabilities particularly answering challenging questions besetting young minds. Certain civil society and non-governmental organizations are already working on similar projects to train mothers in identification of early signs of radicalization in children and equip them with correct set of responses to guide their children.

33. **ELECTING OF CLASS MONITORS IN SCHOOLS**

Entrenchment of democratic values and processes begins at early age. Schools may encourage children to elect class monitors or representatives through simple raising of hands or voting. Children will know the impact of selecting their leaders since early age.

34. **Mapping of Prison inadequacies**

Prison reform history is replete with multiple vocational and educational programs to rehabilitate criminals. However, there is immediate requirement for strategies to rehabilitate or reform terrorists. Imprisonment or execution of criminal elements is seen as an inadequate response for mitigation of crime. Analogy can be safely extended to extremists and terrorists convicted in most heinous crimes against society and state. Not all terrorists, extremists, and potential extremists or terrorists can be placed under preventive detention indefinitely or executed altogether. A realistic intervention covering pre-arrest, during arrest and post-release stages is required for reformation, rehabilitation, reintegration and renunciation of violence by these individuals.

Multiple projects have been proposed hereinafore having impact on generating awareness, inclusion, openness and engagement. Such measures are incomplete without strategy to ensure safety of prison environments and detention centers from becoming academies for radicalization and recruitment. Securitized response by security officials is deemed short-term and at the expense of long-term sustainable reforms that may benefit the prisoners and community in the long run. Peer to peer radicalization remains neglected in Pakistan. Prison staff is not immune from radicalization as witnessed in 2014 in Rawalpindi Adyala Jail incident. Thus, the problem extends to include prison staff and inmates indicating disturbing trends.

Impact of detention is not limited to detainees but extends to their family members, relatives, friends and even the communities of detained individuals. The spillover of prison experience affects families of inmates and their communities at large. A well designed program is required to disengage, de-radicalize inmates, safeguard prison staff against radicalization and build community trust in possibility of reintegration of extremists back in society through a holistic institutional and social response approach. Renouncement of extremists’ path as false is deemed imperative to save communities from subscribing to the extremist’s ideology.
A well designed and executed 4 R program can go a long way towards de-radicalization, building community acceptability of formers (terrorists), reducing recruitment and recidivism rate. It will ensure better safety of community by diminishing the potential risks posed by releasing a hardened, and un-de-radicalized/active extremist back in to society. Routine, ill, unfair, harsh treatment of detainees will reinforce their conceptions. It ends up in cultivating a new generation of descendants of violent extremists vouchsafing to seek revenge on the system, state, its officials and other members of society. An unattended extremists thrown back in to society is as dangerous as a live grenade ready to explode resulting in either actual physical damage or spreading extremists’ ideology. Risk is multiplied by negative influence on family and community.

Provincial level evaluation of prison conditions and current reform programs (if any) for rehabilitation of violent extremist offenders is deemed imperative to ‘map’ issues, synergize efforts with problems and designing of appropriate response. Simultaneously, mapping of current interventions can enable authorities to channelize response program in line with requirements and minimize duplication.

35. Rehabilitation Centers

In addition to providing fora for a law-based polity, where rights are guaranteed and basic socio-economic needs are in place there would be need for rehabilitating those previously involved in extremist activities. Rehabilitation Centers may be established at Federal, Provincial and Divisional level.

The extremists may be divided in to administrative categories viz. surrendered, potential, post-conviction/sentenced, and taken to part of de-radicalization with inclusion of families and local community. Attempt should be made to rehabilitate the individuals through the families, local village elders, ulema, psychological intervention and economic incentives and not through imprisonment or physical incarceration.

Step II includes development of modules for rehabilitation addressing ideological content, perception engagement, psychological rehabilitation, economic integration and stake-building, and above all well-deliberated social integration.

Step III may include devising methodology of reintegration with decision on duration of attachment with family and community, psychological and intelligence clearance, undertaking by community and family, surety bonds by families.

Step IV involves a “Reintegration Package” with offer for vocational training, provision of stipends through Small and Medium Enterprise Units, soft loans, participation in community gathering and employment opportunities. It may be linked with the Illaqa committee and police at district level as support structure for operational efficiency.

Reform programs may be introduced inside prison facilities. Change agents should be selected carefully. Influence chances are further increased where, the agent of intervention enjoys credible authority within a relevant field of knowledge, prominent social standing within a relevant social group, or is seen to represent a number of values common with the target of intervention. For example, in 2004, Indonesian authorities initiated a de-radicalization program that managed to persuade around two dozen members of the Jemaah Islamiah to parole to repent and cooperate with police. The innovative plan employed former jihadists to wean radicals away from terror. Moreover, an external intervention should stay close to the potential exiters own doubts that may take various forms. The influence attempt may be as subtle as possible. The narratives and self-affirmatory strategies may be employed to reduce resistance to multiple views. The developing process may take in consideration the possibility of promoting attitudinal change via behavioural change as an alternative to change or influence beliefs directly. Mentor and Mentee mental connectivity process can kindle with entry of a person, who in a credible and convincing way represents a different perspective from the militant’s in a non-threatening manner. It puts pressure on the militants’ narrative dividing the world in to ‘us’ and ‘them’ making them see their narrative from the outside without kindling their defenses.

To provide alternate livelihood there is need for education with scholarships, technical and vocational training, provision of grants and loans through cash transfers for employment-generating activities, and small and medium Enterprises.
Disappointment can occur when the leaders are exposed to be unable to live up to the ideals of unflinching support, physical strength, universal claims, courage, principles and intelligence. Exists can also occur due to personal and pragmatic factors including burn out, war fatigue, age, on run lifestyle, missing loved ones, desire for a normal life, or guilt upon impact of one’s extremism on loved ones.

Inculcation of a “correct” interpretation of religion is regarded as an effective and durable reformation an extremist might undergo. Discussion and dialogue may be undertaken with scholars, clerics, ex militants or other credible authority figures, to convince the participants that militant ideology is theologically and ideologically wrong and instead imprint messages that promote messages of peace and harmony. Though direct messages but such short liners will be reiterated and imprinted upon human mind with relative ease.

Terrorist inmates will search for ways to contribute to extend the cause of their organization through mobilizing other inmates, refusing to cooperate with prison management, and even by developing written works on exalting their mission and organization. Need is not only protection of inmates but of prison staff from radicalization. Incapacitation and segregation of inmates should not be seen as the solution. The more post release interaction mechanism is strong the better are chances of watching and preventing recidivism and re-recruitment. Prison is a place of vulnerability. Prison staff should be professional and well trained. However, they cannot be expected to be theologians. A dedicated team of psychologists and religious scholars may be employed to regularly interact and discuss religious and mental health issues with prison staff. Modules may be developed for terrorists including Salafi Jihadi ideology and literature countering the stance by terrorist organizations and study of major Islamic scholars.

Implementation committees for the project may be established at Federal, Provincial and Divisional / District levels. Rehab centers may be established at all above levels under concerned administrations/agencies. The Module of Rehabilitation may include: ideological corrective / perception measures; psychological rehabilitation; economic empowerment; social integration. The reintegration package may also include: vocational training package; provision of stipends / through SMEs; soft loans; encourage community gatherings; employment opportunity / abroad / inland. Presently, Sabaoon is the solitary success model for rehabilitation and reintegration of former extremists and terrorists in society. Success lessons and best practices from the Sabaoon model to be incorporated at such centers.

De-radicalization, disengagement, and rehabilitation are two-ways processes, wherein the inmate and community both need to recognize the reality of radicalization and possibility of de-radicalization and persuaded to smoothly accept the individual back. In this background, policing and surveillance to oversee post-release behavioural patterns and recidivism rate are not adequate and have to be employed sensitively. It is immensely difficult to assess and declare that an inmate has been de-radicalized and is ready to be returned to the community. Thus police may actively engage and work with community for meaningful and lasting reintegration of the former back in to society. Again, the Sabaoon model can serve as best practice for achieving lasting results as it has practical on field experience.

When the prisoner undergoes the interaction and reformation process then his post release surveillance mechanism should to be hybrid i.e. security plus community based. The entire exercise may have a social monitoring mechanism with police, district administration, local influential kept informed of activities and ideological proclivities of the individual through immediate family and local community members. Thus, the programme will have a reformation and post release surveillance strategy to ensure his guided reintegration in society through society itself in collaboration with state authorities.

36. Probation and Parole

A school of thought discourages segregation of prisoners but deliberations suggested that the course is preferable in Pakistan. The presence of mafias inside prisons other than terrorist influence is another recruiting base for first time offenders inter alia. Thus, the first phase may be strict segregation of terrorists, extremists and hardened criminals from ordinary criminals. Segregation of juvenile offenders from ordinary criminals and terrorists and of high profile terrorists from second tier supporters or sympathizers or extremists is needed to ensure no mentorship frameworks are evolved. The decision is based on evidence of radicalization of prisoners and predominance of terrorist influence over other mafia attachments in prisons.
Second phase may include a holistic religious, psychological, economic, and capacity building program in prisons. When prisoners are stripped of their external identities and contacts the prisonisation effect takes place, which grows helplessness and limitation in inability to return to normal environment. Following may be selected for this program:

- For juvenile delinquents, supervised living and compulsory education/vocational skill development may be arranged. In addition to personal social supervision, cash sureties provided by families, local elders.

- Women offenders may be given supervised living and compulsory education and skill development. Their release on probation and parole with cash sureties may be provided by family, local elders should also be considered.

- First time Offenders except in heinous offences.

- Drug Users, addicts and mentally disturbed persons should be immediately referred and treated for rehabilitation.

Institutionalized efforts may be made for resolution of dispute between parties, fines and compensation, etc. for rehabilitation of such individuals back in to society. It should be avoided to incarcerate such offenders in prisons.

Probation and Parole regime requires attention as it has potential to reduce overcrowding of prisons and avoid hardening of new offenders in addition to other advantages. However, probation and parole officers largely lack basic transportation facilities to efficiently perform their field duties including community visits for reintegration of offenders or attending offices of their assigned officers. The number of probation and parole officers and robust coordination between parole staff and prison management is imperative for adequate and timely intervention.

The syllabi of the National Academy for Prison Administration, Judicial Academy and Police Training Academies may also include elaborate modules on effectiveness of probation and parole. It can help in effective communications between police, probation and parole officers and judiciary. The total combined strength of probation and parole officers stood at around 89 for entire Punjab and 33 for the entire Sindh province and in many districts the Probation officers are given additional charge of Parole. Sindh appointed additional 15 Probation and 13 Parole officers in March 2012. Reclamation & Probation Directorate lacks proper service structures that results in de-motivated staff. The R&P Directorates do not have any research and development units to maintain easily shared record to estimate ratios of recidivism. The Directorate is neglected and under resourced, whereas it can play a central role in reintegration of offenders in to community and reduce prison over-crowding.

Under these circumstances and constraints, it is highly beneficial to include families for surveillance and surety of prisoners released on probation or parole to assist the officers in having effective supervision. Existing prison and parole legal and structural framework may be supplemented with having mentors from the community of the inmate or former. It is more practicable to make the community in-charge of such guidance and monitoring intervention. Affinity between the change agent and the target of intervention, for example common friends, backgrounds, or interests, generally promotes reliance, and reliance enhances the ability of the agent of intervention to get through to the target successfully.

Thus, afore-mentioned classes of individuals after fulfilling the imprisonment period or recommended for probation or parole may preferably be given in the custody of their family and mentor from their communities. Making family and community responsible for their conduct will generate engagement between state and communities, enable authorities to have a network of surveillance on these individuals without incurring resources and protect the released inmate and community from receding in to crime.
37. **Special employment opportunities**

Special employment opportunities may be offered to these prisoners for their respectable reintegration in to society. To provide alternate livelihood there would be immense need for education with scholarships, technical and vocational training, provision of grants and loans through cash transfers for employment-generating activities, and small and medium Enterprises.

38. **Ulema Boards**

A provincial observatory, on the pattern of Punjab Ulema Board may be established in all provinces and a cell in police department, may be created to check literature and syllabi etc. to be categorized as hate material in collaboration with the Board. Concerned police authorities may share their observations on material falling in hate material classification with the Ulema Board. The Ulema Board may make final recommendation for ban and confiscation.

39. **Auqaf**

Provincial governments may re-organize their Auqaf departments so that mosques controlled by Auqaf are used only for social harmony and peace building in accordance with injunctions of Islam. The following steps are recommended to the provincial governments:

- Introduce an ACR system of khateebs of Auqaf mosques based on service record and for future job prospects,
- Make a duty register of khateebs of Auqaf department such that khateebs deliver sermons in different mosques on rotation basis,
- Ulema boards to issue guidelines about topics for Jumma sermons for projection and realization of a true Islamic society.

40. **Establishment of Reconciliation Commissions**

Establishment of Reconciliation Commissions at Provincial and National levels may be undertaken by concerned governments in liaison with each other. These may be managed by tribal leaders, political leadership, former judges, senior most civil and military bureaucrats having rendered distinguished services, religious leaders and scholars from all schools of thought, inter alia at the provincial level. These distinguished people of credence should develop reconciliation strategies for target groups, areas and even individuals. These may be linked horizontally and vertically to each other.

Secondly, these Commissions may continuously review their Reconciliation Policies and recommend course corrections. The National Counter Terrorism Authority should be the connecting platform at the central level for establishing liaison within these provincial commissions. Parliamentary Committee on National Security may discuss and build consensus over these policies in accordance with guidelines for a broad national reconciliation policy.

In congruence of the reconciliation policy adopted for Balochistan, a national level reconciliation policy may be drafted for the country. Reconciliation may not be restricted to armed or extremist groups alone rather it may be exercised at all levels of the society. The State policies may be implemented across the board.

Implementation may remain with relevant governments including administrative and LEAs apparatus. In reconciliation process with militant groups such as those active in Balochistan, local Sardars and people with high stature in the society may also be taken on board. It will maintain a repository of best practices and case studies of former militants. The policy may be extended across the board in complementarity of other reconciliation initiatives.
F. Promotion of culture

“Cultural policy of Pakistan must reflect the most enviable and diverse cultural narrative of the land, life and people, representing the dreams, aspirations, sorrows, happiness, struggle, and achievements of its proud custodians with utmost sincerity. Creative and critical engagement between people, transpire creativity, innovation and reciprocity resulting in tangible and intangible cultural forms of association to share with the world. The Cultural Policy should embody the futuristic vision of a peaceful, prosperous, pluralistic and free society and become a catalyst in bridging the gap between the true potential of Pakistan and its realization.”

Vision statement by “Promotion of Culture” Group, 16th July 2016 Workshop on NCEP

41. Inter Provincial Cultural Exchanges and Cultural Hubs

Environment should be evolved, where performing artists from one province are allowed and enabled to perform in another province on regular basis at large scale. Theater and cultural art centers may have formal residency programmes for artists from other provinces. Attachments of artists on cross-provincial basis may be made a part of provincial harmony initiatives. Incidents of tensions in educational institutions with cross provincial representation, such as Punjab University, can be addressed through robust security measures for a certain period of time. However, cultural assimilation and tolerance will emerge through cultural exposure, interaction leading to knowledge.

Cultural industrial hubs may be established at district or divisional level. Such hubs will promote local culture and make it marketable amongst local and foreign tourists. Culture streets on the pattern of Multan, where local and traditional crafts are displayed, to be developed to turn it in to a hub for cultural activities for locals publicized through media. Local industry may not to be limited to production etc. but to include enterprises in culture. Select model districts or divisions may establish cultural streets and industrial hubs which may be gradually replicated and expanded in other areas. International media campaign for promotion of culture and tourism in Pakistan may be undertaken on immediate basis.

42. Promotion of Visual Arts: Following steps may be undertaken for promotion of visual arts:

- Curatorship and exhibitions may be funded through a series of programs at Federal and Provincial levels.
- Rhymes, folk tales, tongue twisters and parables of all Pakistani languages may be recorded in the form of illustrated books, audio CDs and animations be made for children.
- The National and Provincial Galleries may be rejuvenated with new collections and adding professional expertise in documenting, curating, authenticating, restoring and promoting all disciplines of visual arts. It may have a formalized relationship with educational institutions to provide exposure of visual art treasures to the youth.
- Since the study of visual arts is not a priority for families or for society so far, a national scholarship program which hunts for talent in underprivileged areas, both rural and semi urban, may be undertaken.
- State patronage in the visual arts should to be visibly reflected in state media through programming and funding of art education.
- PNCA may hold National Exhibition every year.
- PNCA may hold International Biennale every two years.
- PNCA may hold a Truck Art contest and award prizes to the best Trucks, Rickshaws and Vans.
- Establishing Community Cultural Clubs may be encouraged to ensure a broad based documentation of tradition bearers and promotion of talent and cultural activity.
• The tradition bearers (artists, artisans and folklorists) may be encouraged and empowered through interest free loans to revive production of cultural goods and skills by establishing workshops and bai’takhs.

• Visits of tradition bearers to schools in their respective communities may be facilitated to encourage interaction and awareness of traditional skills among children.

43. Promotion of Theater

• Providing theatre space for performances may be a high priority as part of strategy establishing cultural infrastructure, including use of free or affordable space through the Government Institutions. In addition, scrutiny bodies may be encouraged to grant maximum possible freedom to theatre groups to address social, cultural and political themes.

• Starting theater festivals in provinces and federal capital jointly by PNCA and provincial arts councils in all languages.

• PNCA may set up its theater, dance and music academies.

• Educational institutions may be encouraged to include theatre and arts in curriculum and extra-curricular. Also may facilitate organization of inter-provincial and national theatre competitions and festivals for youth as well as professional theatre groups.

• Pakistan National Council of Arts may dedicate awards to appreciate high achievers in the field of theatre arts including playwrights, directors, actors, set designers, lighting designers, music composers and translators.

• National institutions may publish scripts in indigenous languages. Public and private, both schools may encourage their students to develop plays in these languages. Non-commercial but culturally significant theatre to be supported.

• International collaborations may be undertaken for doing joint plays with neighboring countries or others known for theatre to promote Pakistan’s culture inside and outside Pakistan both.

• The Government may review the excise & taxation conditions for theatre performances.

44. Folklore and Traditional Culture

• Cultural Mapping of tangible and intangible cultural elements may be recorded in a virtual skill database.

• Live folk music performances may be encouraged at government functions so that they become a part of our lives. Challenging and stringent rules that become a hurdle while organizing live performances may be reviewed and simplified.

• Arranging folk artisans to teach their crafts to school children on a regular basis can not only generate respect for their talent, but also give them enough exposure and basis to transform it with their own expression in their later years.

• Lok Virsa may document, children’s folk games, tales, tongue twisters, parables and rhymes of all areas and languages. These may be published in the form of illustrated books, animations and audio/video CDs/DVDs as learning kits for school children.

• Cultural institutions may play the role of a catalysts, equipped with budgets, governance and meritorious appointments for their leadership.

• Promotion of our folk traditions may be made an element of our foreign policy and image building internationally. Regular exchange of artists, artisans, research scholars and other related practitioners may be encouraged.
45. **Preservation of Visible Culture: Archeological Sites**

- All international agreements for excavation and research may ensure that Pakistan benefits from the outputs. A more detailed policy may be formulated regarding conditions for permission to excavate, what to excavate, relationship with the international partners and how to systematically document and promote these sites. The Provinces may set their priorities and actively link up with each other to have a cohesive plan.

- Special legislation and implementation mechanism may be devised to stop theft of old artifacts and smuggling of antiques outside Pakistan.

- Private encroachment of the archeological sites may be curbed, where people have bought the land with precious archeological sites and built houses on them.

- National Archives, National Documentation Centre and other such institutions may be digitized and made more accessible to researchers, writers and scholars within the purview of the Freedom of Information law.

- Public private partnerships may be undertaken to turn heritage architecture into a conduit for profitable rejuvenation for local economy such as through sound’n’light shows and live drama extravaganzas. Once people realize that this can be a source of income they become natural guardians.

- A museum may be established in every District to engage the community and facilitate the younger generation to connect with local history.

- Safeguard monuments with scientific and technical investigations and guidelines for environmentally sound usage and preservation without adverse impact.

- Authorized replicas of iconic artifacts in different materials may be made and made available at all museums and crafts shops.

46. **Passing on Cultural Heritage to Next Generations**

- Transferring of cultural identity to next generations involves a process of socialization. Society must reflect the values it intends to pass on, factoring in all modes of socialization including family, education system and the electronic and social media.

- Schools may facilitate a new pluralist narrative which inculcates pride in our rich heritage, rather than promote a monolithic worldview where sameness is taken as harmony.

- Schools may invite tradition bearers to engage children into a process of informed cultural learning and to develop respect for the tradition bearers.

- School curricula may be attuned with the child’s needs, interests and age. It is to introduce multiplicities and complexities of identity to generate value for culture, peace and various ethnicities. Teaching styles to embody democratic values, creative expression, reflection, critical thinking and activity. Education in mother languages may be encouraged, the modes of which depend on the provinces.

- To achieve these aims, Cultural Studies as a subject may be considered for school curriculum. This would span a range including, a) our cultural history, indigenous context and its relevance, b) wisdom of folk poets and indigenous philosophers, c) creative arts and d) the concept of cultural identity and pride.

- Media currently serves a limited need of cultural education for children. PTV and Pakistan Radio, both were more engaged in the past and their role must be enhanced. The State may prioritize programs that celebrate diversity.
47. **Cinema**

- A National Academy of Film may be established, which will develop a Film Archive.
- National Film Awards may be resumed to acknowledge the best talent of our country, inspire and incentivize to young artists.
- Government may facilitate links with other countries in terms of joint funding and production projects, and provide institutional support for distribution of Pakistani films in other countries.
- Pakistani films may become progressive cultural ambassadors internationally and give a more real and diverse cultural image of Pakistan internationally.
- NAFDEC may be revived and placed under the National Fund for Cultural Heritage.
- Government may encourage building of new cinema complexes in order to increase the number of screens.
- Government may tax all foreign films but local cinema/films to be given tax relaxations.

48. **Music Academy: Following steps may be undertaken as per context:**

- A certificate program in the field of Music, with courses in history of music, ethnomusicology, South Asian genres of music, with a focus on folk instruments.
- Tutoring of a range of musical instruments and singing.
- An engaging museum of music targeting youth, with interactive displays of musical instruments encouraging young people to pursue music and get to know their heritage.
- A unified culture curriculum may be commissioned by the federal government, wherein representatives and experts from all provinces are involved in the process of preparation of a ‘national cultural curriculum’ for early and elementary education. The culture curriculum should become part of Pakistan studies.

49. **Protecting Culture of Minorities**

- All seasonal festivals (e.g. Lohri, Nauroze, Basant, Holi, Vesakhi) may be declared as national festivals with official celebrations.
- Restore, preserve and promote tourism around all religious monuments as our national heritage.
- The Evacuee Trust Board may devise strategy to further ensure complete transparency in financial matters, especially related to donations given by the faithful.
- Promote the leadership and participation of artists, writers, musicians from religious minority communities and encourage positive portrayal in the media.
- Include lessons bringing out affinity and tolerance towards other minorities.
- Take action against those who discriminate and promote hatred and prejudice among different communities and incite violence.
- Ensure the safety and security of all its citizens, especially its minorities and vulnerable communities, and provide necessary security at places of worship, religious monuments and festivals.
50. Protecting Endangered Cultures, Cultural Sites, Crafts and Languages

Certain manifestations of this rich heritage have debilitated or destroyed due to negligence or collusion by on-ground actors. There are illegal black markets and traders of antiquities, who sell stolen artifacts both within the country and abroad. There are also private profiteers, who have connived and illegally purchased state land on which cultural sites are located, bringing it in the domain of private property. These have resulted in many such sites becoming endangered.

Part of the problem is the social processes that privilege grafting of single-dimensional, hegemonic identities as definitive, unified Pakistani culture. It is critical to see Pakistani culture as plural, as constitutive of many cultures. The attempt at defining a singular culture has led to domination of one stream to which all others must integrate and adapt. Kallash valley has only a population of 3500 indigenous people left. Certain languages such as Wakhi, certain dresses such as laachas find no traction in the mainstream, and celebration of ancient festivities such as Nowruz are dying down.

The third tier of threats to vanishing heritage concerns the stresses of globalization. As technology progresses and certain manual modes become redundant or replaced, certain arts are vanishing, such as musical instruments and their players, specifically the alghoza and sarangi, or particular stitches women used for embroidery, or particular ways of using natural dyes etc. While people have a right to choose what they use and how, as a dignified nation with a proud history, Pakistan must preserve their place in history and value the expertise.

The following are priority steps that may be undertaken:

- Upholding the plurality of cultures by encouraging their depictions and showcasing the most endangered of cultural manifestations
- State-led celebrations of events such as Nowroz, Holi, Baisakhi and others. Provinces may monitor the state of heritage sites. They may ensure compliance of protective laws such as the Antiquities Act 1975 and take action against illegal private profiteering
- May ensure that marginal groups can express and celebrate their cultures without pressure and risk from local majority communities
- May create incentives such as stipends for people involved in protecting or practicing dying art forms such as playing the alghoza.
**IMPLEMENTATION MECHANISM FOR NATIONAL COUNTER EXTREMISM POLICY GUIDELINES**

Following mechanism is recommended for consideration as per context by provincial governments including AJK, GB and FATA.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Para. No.</th>
<th>Intervention</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
<th>Approximate Cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Efficient Service Delivery through strengthening District and Tehsil Admin-</td>
<td>Provincial Chief Secretaries with concerned provincial departments,</td>
<td>May be estimated and proposed by the concerned authorities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>istrations and raising of pay and allowances of government servants for</td>
<td>Rep. from PMO, Secretary Est. Div., Finance Div/ Deptt, and any other member(s)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>efficient: High Level Committee (HLC) to be formed at Provincial level to</td>
<td>nominated by the Committee.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>review: • Present powers, functions and resources available to District</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Administration with objective to strengthen them and submit its report to</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>concerned Provincial Chief Ministers including Azad Jammu &amp; Kashmir</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and Gilgit Baltistan. A joint session to be held at national level amongst</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>all provincial committees including AJK and GB to share recommendations/</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>findings before submitting to CMs respectively, and</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Pay and allowances of District Administration in collaboration with</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>relevant Federal ministries/divisions.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>FATA Mainstreaming (linked with # 4)</td>
<td>As given in FATA Commission report and agreed upon by stakeholders.</td>
<td>As finalized by concerned stakeholders.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Resource Allocation to LEAs including secret funds for intelligence based</td>
<td>Linked with Para 1 and to be decided by the High Level Committee at Provincial</td>
<td>Adequate resources may be provided to Police for effective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>operations inter alia.</td>
<td>level in consultation with IGP.</td>
<td>intelligence based operations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>hydro power/energy resources, irrigation, agriculture, livestock, education,</td>
<td></td>
<td>bodies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>employment generation. (linked with # 2)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>contemporary subjects; regulation, interaction and ensuring audit of</td>
<td>Rep from ITMP.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>madressah to be left to local level i.e. Deputy Commissioner/DCO, District</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Police and Special Branch.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Check and Balance and External Accountability for failure to ensure public peace, tranquility, security and service delivery</td>
<td>Prov. CS and IGP to evolve mechanism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/8.</td>
<td>Para(s)7&amp;8: Establishment of Illaqa Committee barae aman aur behbud in provinces including AJ K and GB; Committee for FATA to be formed by FATA Secretariat with grass root administrative footprints and inclusion.</td>
<td>Chief Secretaries inc. AJ K and GB as per given composition with Centralized Monitoring Units at Prov. CMs Offices with rep. from all concerned depts. NACTA.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10, 11, 12, 13, 15</td>
<td>Victim humanization and deconstruction of violent narratives Post-Incident Communication Strategy Council of Complaints, Section 26 of PEMRA Act at Federal and Provincial levels to be widely publicized and activated Media Cell on CVE Online Behaviour code of Ethics</td>
<td>To be estimated by the media cell.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Issuance of media cards to unauthorized persons in Bal. (Other prov. govt. to share best practices and may opt for the intervention through M/o IB or Inf. Depts.)</td>
<td>M/o I&amp;B, Bal. Info. Dept. and media reps.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 32, 33, & 34, | National Education Policy as under formulation at M/o FE & PT with relevant provincial governments to include:  
- Teacher Training,  
- 100% Enrollment, (linked to para 4),  
- Curriculum Scrutiny Bodies,  
- Provincial Text Books Repositories,  
- Online behavior Code of Ethics for schools (related to para 15),  
- Religious education and student interactions,  
- Teaching global civilizations,  
- Madaris and Contemporary School Teacher Exchange Program,  
- Common value system,  
- Community Service,  
- Madaris offering specialized programmes,  
- Internship programmes with provincial and federal department  
- Debates on Contemporary Issues,  
- Counter Narrative Libraries,  
- Art and Culture Education,  
- Mother Schools,  
M/o RA, M/o FE & PT, NACTA, Prov. Education Depts. & ITMP for madaris related interventions. |
|   | Madaris reforms may be allocated adequate resources by government and may be managed and administered by concerned Education Departments for reforms. Distribution may take place as per number of madaris and total number of students. Provincial governments to allocate for internships depending on number of universities. |  
---
| 42 & 43 | National Reconciliation Policy National Truth and Reconciliation Commission at Federal and Provincial levels | Parliamentary Committee on Nat. Security, Prov. Cabinet Comm. On law and order including. AJ K, GB, political representation from FATA and Balochistan to be as per magnitude of problem i.e. high, GHQ, NACTA, ISPR |  |
| 44 | Promotion of Culture: Includes: Inter-provincial exchange of cultural activities, Cultural complexes at select districts, Visual Arts, Theater, Folklore and Traditional Culture, Preservation of Visible Culture: Archeological sites, Passing on heritage to next generations, Cinema Music Academy, Protecting Culture of Minorities, Protecting endangered cultures, cultural sites, crafts and languages, | Prov. Culture and Tourism Depts. M/o Sports & Culture, M/o IPCC, FATA Secretariat, Transportation Dept., Home Dept., Arts and Culture Councils, PNCA. NACTA | To be estimated by committee at NACTA. |
Terms of Reference for Functioning of the Illaqa Aman wa Behbud Committees

These Committees may work on following lines:

1) Formation of cross-population groups of a compact size not exceeding 15-20 at a time and arrange one workshop or gathering minimum twice a month on multiple issues besetting us as individuals and citizens. Such groups shall have representation of women. These groups may be formed in each Union Council level or equivalent administrative level. Balochistan had expressed concerns to form such Committee on District level given the complex and peculiar situation. These groups may remain functional for 3-4 months and then fresh group will be formed while dissolving the previous one. Attention should be given to composition of these groups of having people from diverse backgrounds in each group. Alternatively these can be profession specific which will enable people to interact and network with people of interest and relevance. However, cross societal representation should be the priority.

2) These groups may be encouraged to map issues facing their locality, which shall enable the local administration to have a first-hand knowledge and understanding of local issues through local knowledge. The feed-back should be systematically recorded for each locality and will be sent to the SMU. Indigenous problem profiling, local public identification and indigenous proposed solutions will be three most advantageous outcomes of these gatherings repeated with each group. Also the Assistant Commissioner or DC/DCO may be required to make a systematic record of the mapping of problems and issues. Future development, health and education interventions can be made on basis of such scientific first-hand local input available.

3) Model for engaging groups at the basic neighbourhood level will require the concerned AC or DC/DCO to include/involve various government agencies or civil society organizations or non-governmental organizations etc. to interact and enrich knowledge/information base of these groups. The topics can vary from a range of issues which are directly beneficial for the locality from which the group is coming, the issues may include:

4) Health awareness lectures, Population control and small family units through inclusion of local religious figures, Skill development and vocational training, Peace and tolerance, hygiene and responsibility to keep locality clean, establishing small business, livestock raring and care, better parenting, better neighbours, police as our guardians, etc. and it can go on to include multitude of issues from local to national significance. Representatives from concerned government departments may be invited to reach out to people at the most basic administrative unit level and interact on any issue of relevance and significance during these workshops. NGOs/CSOs may also be an integral part of these workshops and can be coopted by the AC or DC/DCO or any member of the Committee in consultation with the Administration for working with public in these workshops. Provincial governments may also train mentors or specialists on various issues including issues relevant and significant to public, who will engage with public through these workshops across the province. Moreover, local administration and police may also be engaging with people at this forum.

5) Ensuring continued participation of people in these sessions will be a challenge to be met by members of the committee through incentive and interest creation. Such workshops can be accompanied with health camps for free medical check-up, eye check-up camps, sports events, for larger population. Through NGOs and micro finance institutions the distribution of items like flour, sewing machine, small loans etc. can also be used as an incentive.

6) Members of these Committees may also be empowered to resolve local level small disputes of civil nature as mediators, neutral persons and alternate dispute resolution mechanisms. It will result in local settlement of disputes and will generate ownership and credibility for the Committees within the population. Administration, Police, local notables and most significantly the elected representatives are
part of these Committees and will be able to settle small disputes which can be referred for arbitration as per prevailing laws. As a step further, amendments in respective provincial arbitration laws may be introduced to have arbitration role vested in already existing offices within state.

7) The overall objective in people’s engagement, inclusion and connectivity. These are small well entrenched discussion forums which will minimize prospects of hidden and unquestioned existence of terrorists and extremists by opening people to each other and each other’s ideas. It is also a whole of government and society approach where all concerned agencies of government and civil society will join hands for public inclusion. End objective and vision will be shared by all these agencies and attainment of any objective is impossible without peace and tolerance in society.

8) The ACs or DCs/DCOs may be made responsible to report to the Chief Minister’s Special Monitoring Units about the activities and progress of these committees within their respective jurisdictions. An annual report of each Union Council may be compiled and submitted to the SMU by the concerned officers of the Administration. Impact assessment may also be calculated on the number of participants enlisted and present in such exercises.

9) Culture, arts and community events have been affected by securitized response to such activities. Committee may ensure planning, facilitation, and organizing of these events by communities. Media should be integrated for coverage and of such activities. Outreach may be extended to basic school and locality level. It shall be reinforced by similar activities across the state.

**Legislation**

The working of Secretary Union Council in concert with Assistant Commissioner in addition to Elected Representative can be made through a policy directive.

The inclusion of families and communities in surveillance mechanism for probation and parole also do not require legislative amendments, unless decided otherwise.

Thus the projects recommended within National Counter Extremism Policy Guidelines will not require any legislative amendments paving way for immediate implementation.

**An evolving document and Reinforcing Commitment to Peace**

These are not static and one-time guidelines. Central Monitoring Unit and Specialized Monitoring Units responsible for implementation of the National Counter Extremism Policy Guidelines and concerned stakeholders may be authorized to introduce changes in these as per context and requirements. They may tailor their own policy responses to counter violent extremism, while keeping this well debated guideline framework in view.

Best practice manual may be developed by all Specialized Monitoring Units to be shared with remaining provinces and stakeholders.

NACTA through the Central Monitoring Unit may be made responsible for coalescing international support and reckoning for the efforts made under NCEPG on its own and as required by any Provincial governments.
ANNEX-A
ANNEX-B

ACTION AGAINST MISUSE OF LOUDSPEAKER

ACTION AGAINST HATE SPEECH
ANNEX-C

KARACHI OPERATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AREA</th>
<th>STATUS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Target Killing</td>
<td>97% Down</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Murder</td>
<td>87% Down</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terrorism</td>
<td>98% Down</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robberies</td>
<td>52% Down</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weapons Recovered</td>
<td>33,378</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ANNEX-D

KARACHI OPERATION
# ANNEX-E

## NATIONAL ACTION PLAN ENABLERS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TASK</th>
<th>Pun</th>
<th>Sind</th>
<th>KPK</th>
<th>Bal</th>
<th>ICT</th>
<th>GB</th>
<th>AJ K</th>
<th>FATA</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Combing</td>
<td>111871</td>
<td>60807</td>
<td>39846</td>
<td>1760</td>
<td>944</td>
<td>1150</td>
<td>498</td>
<td>602</td>
<td>217478</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stop and Search</td>
<td>3957126</td>
<td>116600</td>
<td>2887</td>
<td>17169</td>
<td>12468</td>
<td>4876</td>
<td>4006</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>4115304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arrests</td>
<td>22027</td>
<td>77218</td>
<td>194144</td>
<td>9194</td>
<td>4565</td>
<td>690</td>
<td>1667</td>
<td>1551</td>
<td>311056</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IBOs</td>
<td>2062</td>
<td>239</td>
<td>1164</td>
<td>8992</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>12884</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helpline</td>
<td>2991</td>
<td>219</td>
<td>302</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>201</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3802</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intelligence Shared</td>
<td>412</td>
<td>993</td>
<td>1313</td>
<td>621</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>173</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>1308</td>
<td>5173</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ANNEX-F

NATIONAL ACTION PLAN ENABLERS

[Image of document]